

COMMITTEE ON ECUMENICAL RELATIONS MAY 2018

Proposed Deliverance

The General Assembly:

1. Receive the Report.
2. Adopt *Local, Universal and Shaped by the Mission of God: An Ecumenical Policy for the Church of Scotland* as the Ecumenical Policy of the Church of Scotland. (Section 2.2.2)
3. Note *Local, Universal and Shaped by the Mission of God: An Ecumenical Policy for the Church of Scotland: A Theological Basis*. (Appendix I)
4. Instruct the Committee on Ecumenical Relations to bring a strategy for the implementation of *Local, Universal and Shaped by the Mission of God: An Ecumenical Policy for the Church of Scotland* to the General Assembly of 2019.
5. Concur with the response of the Committee on Ecumenical Relations to the Review of Action of Churches Together in Scotland (ACTS) and agree to transmit the same to the Trustees of ACTS. (Section 3)
6. Note *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*. (Appendix III)
7. Instruct the Committee on Ecumenical Relations to bring recommendations with respect to Action of Churches Together in Scotland, in the context of a strategy for the implementation of the Ecumenical Policy of the Church, to the General Assembly of 2019.
8. Instruct the Committee on Ecumenical Relations to advise the Council of Assembly of any significant matters which require a decision prior to the General Assembly of 2019, with respect to the Action of Churches Together in Scotland Review Process.
9. Approve the delegates to Assemblies, Synods and Conferences of other Churches, as detailed in Appendix IV.
10. Note the appointment of representatives to ecumenical bodies, as detailed in Appendix V.

Report

1. CLARIFYING THE VISION: A SEASON OF REVIEWS

1.1 The theme of review has been a constant in the life of the Committee during recent times. The General Assembly of 2017 received under the Report of the Council of Assembly 'the Council's review of the work of the Ecumenical Relations Committee' which included a revised and renewed Remit for the Committee. Further, the General Assembly instructed the Committee to review the Ecumenical Policy of the Church of Scotland, in consultation with the Council of Assembly, and to report on the review to the General Assembly of 2018.^[1] The Committee now brings a renewed Ecumenical Policy and invites the General Assembly to approve that Policy and to embrace the vision of the Church which is integral to it.

1.2 The present Ecumenical Policy of the Church, as approved by the General Assembly in 2005, has at its heart a commitment to the resourcing of Action of Churches Together in Scotland (ACTS) on the basis of a "Churches Together" model. Equally, as noted in the Report of the Committee on Ecumenical Relations in 2017, ACTS has been subject to a 'comprehensive external review'.^[2] The Review carried out by Theos is now complete.^[3] Equally, at the time of writing, the reception of the Review by the member churches of ACTS is ongoing.^[4] Further, it is anticipated that the reception process, along with engagement with the member churches of ACTS and others, will continue throughout 2018.

1.3 Throughout the past year as the Committee has engaged in reflecting upon the prospective Ecumenical Policy of the Church *and* the ACTS Review process, it has been conscious of the extent to which the former might have been thought to be dependent on the latter. Indeed, as indicated, the present Ecumenical Policy is based on a model which places ACTS at the heart of that Policy. One conclusion that might have been drawn is that the Committee ought to have postponed bringing a renewed Ecumenical Policy until such time as the ACTS Review process had been completed. Having considered this, the Committee came to the view that it ought to set out a Policy on behalf of the Church on the basis that such a Policy, if agreed, would better enable the Church thereafter to envisage the nature of its involvement in a

national ecumenical body. This would necessitate a degree of provisionality with respect to the outworking of any agreed Policy. The Committee is fully conscious of this and concluded, as indicated, that it was important to bring the renewed Ecumenical Policy, as instructed, and gives notice that it shall develop a strategy for the implementation of the Policy, and so complete this task, in its Report to the General Assembly of 2019.

1.4 As we shall see in due course, one of the conclusions of the ACTS Review is that, whatever the final outcome of the process, there is a need to clarify the vision of ecumenism that lies at the heart of our self-understanding of the Church.^[5] The Committee has taken up the theme of “Clarifying the Vision” as a unifying theme for our Report. We now seek to clarify that vision and articulate a Policy consequent to this.

2. CLARIFYING THE VISION: LOCAL, UNIVERSAL AND SHAPED BY THE MISSION OF GOD: AN ECUMENICAL POLICY FOR THE CHURCH OF SCOTLAND

2.1 Present Ecumenical Policy

2.1.1 The present Ecumenical Policy of the Church, as agreed in 2005,^[6] follows from the request of the General Assembly of 2003 to the Committee on Ecumenical Relations to ‘review the ecumenical strategy of the Church of Scotland in Scotland’, in light of the rejection of the Scottish Churches Initiative For Union (SCIFU) proposals. Thereafter, the Committee offered ‘a policy statement [rather] than a set of strategies’.

2.1.2 The Ecumenical Policy is in three Parts, with the policy element found in Part 3: “A Churches Together Policy”.^[7] It states the basis of the Policy, with reference to the Churches Together model, in the following terms:

The Churches Together model unites in pilgrimage those churches which acknowledge God’s revelation in Christ, confess the Lord Jesus Christ as God and saviour according to the Scriptures and in obedience to God’s will and in the power of the Holy Spirit, commit themselves to seek a deepening of their communion with Christ and with one another in the Church, and to fulfil their mission to proclaim the Gospel by common witness and service in the world to the glory of the One God, Father, Son and Holy Spirit.

2.1.3 In terms of what the model requires of the Church of Scotland, there are three elements to the 2005 Policy: 1) The resourcing of structural ecumenism through national and international ecumenical bodies, such as ACTS, Churches Together in Britain and Ireland (CTBI), Churches Together in England (CTE), the Conference of European Churches (CEC), the Community of Protestant Churches in Europe (CPCE), the World Communion of Reformed Churches (WCRC), and the World Council of Churches (WCC); 2) the resourcing of local ecumenism, and; 3) the resourcing of ecumenism within the Councils and Committees of the Church.

2.1.4 The Policy is one that has guided the work of the Committee in the years since 2005 and, throughout that time, it has sought to effectively represent the Church of Scotland in national and international contexts. The contribution of the Church in these contexts has been recognised and affirmed, and noted in the 2017 Review of the work of the Committee by the Council of Assembly.^[8] Nevertheless, it is the view of the Committee that the resourcing of structural ecumenism since 2005 has not been effectively complemented by a resourcing of local ecumenism. Equally, it is clear that the implementation of the Policy has not engaged the Church as effectively as might have been hoped. In the light of this, the Committee is of the view that the time has come for a generational renewal of that Policy.

2.1.5 Notwithstanding these comments, there is a principle that underlies the 2005 Policy which is worth recalling, namely, the Lund Principle.^[9] The Principle was articulated in the context of the Third World Faith and Order Conference at Lund, Sweden in 1952 and has subsequently been affirmed as an axiom within ecumenical circles, albeit that the implications of the axiom have not necessarily been developed beyond the affirmation. In various forms and paraphrases, it is derived from the following:

We would, therefore, earnestly request our Churches to consider whether they are doing all they ought to do to manifest the oneness of the people of God. Should not our Churches ask themselves whether they are showing sufficient eagerness to enter into conversation with other Churches and whether they should not act together in all matters except those in which deep differences of conviction compel them to act separately?^[10]

2.1.6 The Lund Principle was, of course, articulated within a particular context and at a specific time. Nevertheless, the

general context was one in which the challenge to mission in an increasingly secularised society was being addressed. The Principle invites the churches to consider what their response to that challenge is today and, to that extent, it has a quality which is not bound by time.

2.1.7 In the consideration our future Ecumenical Policy, we ought not to lose sight of the potential implications of the Principle articulated.

2.2 Future Ecumenical Policy

2.2.1 The Committee now offers a renewed Ecumenical Policy for the Church of Scotland and, in so doing, believes that it is continuing the trajectory established in its own review in seeking to place an ecumenical understanding of the work of the Church at the heart of our self-understanding. That is, what it is to be concerned for the ecumenical life of the Church is not a consideration to be 'added on' once all other considerations have been attended to. Rather, it is to be concerned for the very self-understanding of the Church in its local and universal expressions complemented by its self-understanding in relation to the mission of God. Equally, the proposed Policy has been shaped by the season of reviews which the Committee has shared in and reflects a desire to offer a vision of ecumenical working together that is comprehensive, comprehensible and relevant to the situation faced by the Church today.

2.2.2 A Theological Basis for the Policy is articulated in Appendix I and this provides an account of the theological foundation of the Policy as well as an indication of some of its potential implications. The Theological Basis should be regarded as the bedrock upon which the Policy rests. Equally, an essential backdrop to the Policy is provided in a sketch of the changing landscape of ecumenism within Scotland, as found in the review of the work of the Committee undertaken by the Council of Assembly and reported to the General Assembly in 2017 (Appendix II).^[1] The intention of the Committee is to offer a Policy that is local in its focus, universal in its intention and shaped by a vision of the mission of God. Equally, we note, as indicated, that it would be the intention of the Committee to bring a strategy for the implementation of the Policy to the General Assembly of 2019. The proposed Policy is as follows:

Local, Universal and Shaped By the Mission of God: An Ecumenical Policy for the Church of Scotland

The Basis

God's Mission has a Church and it is the One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic Church. It is the Universal Church of which the Church of Scotland is a part and which is expressed in each Local Church. God calls the Church of Scotland to share in the mission of God and, in the light of this, to remove any obstacles that hinder our cooperation with our sisters and brothers in Christ.

The Life of God

The life of God is manifest in the Trinity of Father, Son and Holy Spirit. The life of the God of Love is essentially relational and, as Creator, Redeemer and Sustainer, God enters into the life of Creation. The life of God is made known through Jesus Christ as the Life of the world and the Holy Spirit as the Life-giver who empowers and renews Creation.

The Mission of God

The mission of God is an expression of the self-giving of the life of God. The mission of God is rooted in the being of God and is made known in the action of God through the Son and by the Holy Spirit. The mission of God is concerned for the whole of Creation and is made known through the proclamation of the Kingdom of God.

The Church

The Church is shaped by the mission of God whose life is made known in the One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic Church. The life of the Church is primarily expressed in the local Church which is itself an expression of the universal Church. We live out our calling to be the Church by intentionally developing flourishing relationships which embody the life of God.

The Local

The development of flourishing relationships at a local level is realised through the sharing of the gifts that God has given to the people of God in particular, local settings. In the sharing of these gifts:

We shall more fully embody the life of God in the body of Christ through the power of the Holy Spirit.

We shall better enable our sharing in the mission of God through the ministry of the people of God.

We shall encourage participation in active, shared discipleship.

The Universal

The development of flourishing relationships at a universal level is realised in the sharing of the life of God embodied in each part of the Universal Church as it participates in the One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic Church. Our shared realisation takes place through dialogue and in the affirmation of one another through participation in particular regional, national and international bodies and forums. In the sharing of the life of God:

We shall embody the life of God at a regional level as we share our experience in the context of the bodies through which oversight and mutual encouragement takes place.

We shall enable our sharing in the mission of God at a national level as we affirm that God has given to each tradition of the Church a particular insight into the life of God and that in humbly acknowledging one another we acknowledge the presence of God.

We shall encourage participation in the life of the One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic Church at an international level through our identification with the life of Creation and the common challenges we face and, in so doing, live out our response to the prayer of Jesus that we 'may all be one...so that the world may believe'. (John 17: 20-21)

The Principle

The Policy commits the Church of Scotland to the support of the principle that, at local, regional, national and international levels, churches ought to act together except where deep differences of conviction compel them to act separately.

2.2.3 As stated, the proposed Policy is intended to be local in its focus, universal in its intention and shaped by a vision of the mission of God. It provides a Basis which is fully amplified in the attendant Theological Basis for the Policy and offers a vision of the life of God and of the mission of God. The Church is one that is shaped by the mission of God and, in its complementary expressions, is understood to be local in its embodiment of the universal and to be universal in the particularity of the local. The Principle which underlies this is one that has been oft repeated and seldom realised. Once more, the implications of the Policy now require to be developed and it is the intention of the Committee to present these to the General Assembly in 2019. In particular, the implications of the Policy require to be developed in relation

to the wider ecumenical situation within Scotland and, in part, to the ongoing process of the ACTS Review.

3. CLARIFYING THE VISION: ACTION OF CHURCHES TOGETHER IN SCOTLAND: A REVIEW

3.1 ACTS is a national ecumenical body within Scotland and is constituted by nine Member Churches: Church of Scotland; Congregational Federation; Methodist Church in Scotland; Religious Society of Friends (Quakers); Roman Catholic Church; Salvation Army; Scottish Episcopal Church; United Free Church of Scotland, and; United Reformed Church.^[12] Formed in 1990, ACTS understands itself to be the means through which the member churches express their desire to share:

[1] Greater oneness between churches, as Jesus prayed, "that they all may be one" (John 17.21). [2] A growth of understanding and common life between churches. [3] Unified action in proclaiming and responding to the gospel in the whole of life. In its work ACTS seeks to enable the Scottish churches in their common life. It encourages and resources encounters between them in which each participant learns from the other, where difference is explored and respected and where division is healed.^[13]

3.2 The Church of Scotland formally agreed to participate in ACTS at the General Assembly of 1989 and thereafter has remained in full membership of the body and has continued to resource it throughout.^[14] We wish to place on record our appreciation of that which ACTS has accomplished in the past and acknowledge the contribution of those who continue to offer their service within the life of ACTS. To the extent that we offer, or endorse, a criticism of ACTS, we acknowledge that this is, at one and the same time, an acceptance of our responsibility for the situation now faced by ACTS. Equally, it should be understood as a commitment to address the challenges which we face together as churches in Scotland.

3.3 Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review was commissioned by the Trustees of ACTS in 2017 with a brief understood by the appointed external reviewer, Theos, in the following terms:

The task for this review was to gather information on stakeholders' perceptions of the need for a national ecumenical body in Scotland, to establish the views of the present member Churches of ACTS on the current vision, structure and operations of ACTS, and to identify the most effective model for ecumenical co-operation within the context of the contemporary life of the Church in Scotland.^[15]

3.4 With respect to methodology, the information was gathered by Theos through a mixture of interviews and questionnaires.^[16] A summary of the Theos Review is contained in Appendix III.

3.5 The Theos Review was received in December 2017 and has been highlighted within the Council of Assembly and copies sent to all Council Secretaries for comment. The Committee is grateful for the helpful engagement which has flowed from this.

3.6 The Committee considers that the Review comes at an appropriate time in the life of ACTS and that it can be regarded as a significant generational review given the nature of the changes in the shape of the life of the Church in Scotland since 1990, as well as the extent to which Scottish society itself has changed. We consider it to be a fair Review that accurately reflects the perceptions of ACTS which are commonly held and are satisfied that the contributions of the Church of Scotland participants are reflected in the published Review. We consider that Theos has fulfilled the remit given to it and express our thanks for their engagement in the Review process.

3.7 With respect to the content of the Review, we note that the "Strengths and opportunities" section might reasonably be regarded as an affirmation of support for the principle of ecumenism and the vision which ACTS seeks to embody. That is, there is a relative consensus on the need for a body which expresses the shared life of the Church in Scotland. Relatively speaking, there is a limited account of the extent to which those strengths have been realised and opportunities taken.^[17]

3.8 In marked contrast, the section of the Review on the "Weaknesses and areas of concern" records a range of perceptions which we believe are indicative of a disconnect between the Member Churches and ACTS itself with respect

to the vision, structure, operations and administration of ACTS.^[18]

3.9 In principle, we welcome the space which ACTS potentially offers to the churches to hold conversation on matters of common concern. However, we note that those using the space have not grown in number since 1990 and that the conversation held therein cannot necessarily be said to reflect the challenges which the churches in Scotland face. With respect to the former point, it is a matter of concern that ACTS does not reflect the diversity and breadth of the life of the church in Scotland. With respect to the latter, at a time when the theme of mission has come to the fore at local and national levels, as well as within international ecumenism, there has been little emphasis on this in the life of ACTS. Within the published Review, Theos note the relative absence of a focus on mission amongst those participating in the Review process.^[19] With respect to these matters, we agree with the Review and regard ACTS as being out of step with the challenges facing the church in Scotland at this time and that it requires to renew its vision and to broaden its membership base if it is to have a continuing role.

3.10 An emphasis which comes to the fore in the Review and which we anticipate will particularly resonate with the Member Churches of ACTS is the need for ecumenism to be embodied in local expressions. We are of the view that, unless ecumenism is embodied in local expressions of what it is to be the Church of Jesus Christ in partnership with others, ecumenism itself will wither and cease to have relevance within the life of our Church. That having been said, we are conscious of the extent to which creative and collaborative working together, albeit outwith the formal structures of ecumenism, is a feature of the life of our Church. This is especially evidenced at a local level in the results of the Ecumenical Audit carried out by the Committee and reported to the General Assembly in 2014,^[20] as well as in the collaborative working undertaken in the life of the Councils and Committees of the Church of Scotland.

3.11 With respect to the structures, operations and administration of ACTS, it is clear that there is an overwhelming sense that these need to be simplified and clarified in order that it might potentially renew itself. We would strongly endorse the view that unless such a process of simplification and clarification is undertaken then ACTS, as it is presently constituted, will be unable to function as an effective national body.

3.12 The Committee welcomes and endorses the substance of the section of the Review on “Possibilities for the future” with its focus on the need to clarify the vision, restructure and broaden the membership base of any future ecumenical body in Scotland.^[21] We note and conditionally concur with the relative consensus that ACTS ought to be retained, albeit that it ought to be comprehensively reformed, restructured and renewed. We note also the view of a significant minority that ACTS has run its course and ought to be wound up.

3.13 In conclusion, the Committee is of the view that a future ecumenical body must reflect the richness and diversity of the life of the church. Equally, it is of the view that its vision must be primarily shaped by a concern to see ecumenism embodied in local expressions and shaped by a concern for the mission of God. Further, the structure of a future body ought to reflect the functions which its members wish it to undertake and it should be sufficiently flexible as to enable adaption to future change. Whatever the structure adopted, it is imperative that it offers a forum which will enable a welcome to be given to new participants.

3.14 At the time of writing, the process of reception with respect to the Review is ongoing and it is anticipated that proposals for the renewal of ACTS will be forthcoming in due course. It is the intention of the Committee to bring recommendations with respect to ACTS, in the context of a strategy for the implementation of the Ecumenical Policy of the Church, to the General Assembly of 2019. Alongside this, insofar as decisions might require to be taken by the Member Churches before then, the Committee on Ecumenical Relations will advise the Council of Assembly of any significant matters which occur prior to the General Assembly of 2019.

4. THEOLOGICAL FORUM DELIVERANCE ON SAME-SEX MARRIAGE

Under the Report of the Theological Forum, the General Assembly of 2017 approved the following deliverance in relation to the Forum’s Report: *An Approach to the Theology of Same-Sex Marriage*:

Recognising the Church’s doctrine and practice in matters of human sexuality and marriage:

- a) Receive the report “An Approach to the Theology of Same-Sex Marriage” as a resource to the Church and commend it as a basis for study and discussion and instruct the Ecumenical Relations Committee to invite comment and feedback from our ecumenical partners and report to the General Assembly of 2018.

The Committee can advise diligence with respect to the fulfilment of the terms of the instruction and that responses to the Report were passed to the Theological Forum, with the Forum reporting on the substance of the responses in their 2018 Report.

5. CLARIFYING THE VISION: ENGAGING WITH OUR PARTNERS

5.1 World Communion of Reformed Churches

5.1.1 The 26th General Council of the World Communion of Reformed Churches (WCRC) took place in Leipzig, Germany from 29 June to 7 July 2017 on the theme: “Living God, Renew and Transform Us”.

The WCRC’s commitment to gender justice was given focus by the adoption of a *Declaration of Faith on Women’s Ordination* that commits it to work with those member churches which do not permit or fully practise the ordination of women to the ministry of Word and Sacrament. The Ordination of Women is still a contentious issue for some member churches whilst, for others, it is a debate from earlier generations.^[22]

The General Council witnessed a significant occasion in the decision of the WCRC to formally associate with the *Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification*.^[23] The Joint Declaration was agreed by the Roman Catholic Church and the Lutheran World Federation (LWF) and signed on 31 October 1999. In 2006, the World Methodist Council agreed to ‘affirm their fundamental doctrinal agreement with the teaching expressed in the *Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification*’. The ‘Official Common Affirmation’ states:

In this Statement the World Communion of Reformed Churches affirms fundamental doctrinal agreement with the teaching expressed in the Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification signed at Augsburg on 31 October 1999 on behalf of the Lutheran World Federation and the Catholic Church...The present achievement and commitment are viewed by the four parties as part of their pursuit of the full communion and common witness to the world which is the will of Christ for all Christians.
[24]

In the context of the signing of the *Joint Declaration*, the WCRC and the LWF signed the *Wittenberg Witness* committing the two bodies to exploring closer cooperation.^[25]

The Church of Scotland contributed in a number of ways to the Council. Rev Alison McDonald convened the Nominating Committee which led to the election of the Executive Committee and Rev Ian Alexander served as Scribe of the Public Witness Committee. Andrew McPherson was prominent within the work of the Youth Pre-Council and Rev Alexander Horsburgh led the minute taking team, along with Pauline Weibye.

As noted, the association with the *Joint Declaration* took place in the context of events to mark the 500th Anniversary of the Lutheran Reformation and the Anniversary was appropriately marked in Scotland by an ecumenical service held in Holy Trinity Church, St Andrews on 31 October 2017, with St Andrews designated as a European City of the Reformation.^[26] The Most Rev and Rt Hon Rowan Williams, Lord Williams of Oystermouth, preached at the service and members of the churches of St Andrews led worship.

5.2 Roman Catholic Church: Moderatorial Visit to the Vatican

5.2.1 The Rt Rev Dr Derek Browning, accompanied by Anne Mulligan DCS (Chaplain), Rev Dr George Whyte (Principal Clerk) and Rev Dr John L McPake (Ecumenical Officer), was invited to attend a Private Audience with His Holiness Pope Francis in the Vatican City on Thursday, 26 October 2017. Dr Browning and Pope Francis exchanged greetings on behalf of their respective communions, and in the course of the Audience, affirmed that which we hold in common. Dr Browning stated:

Prayers connect us to God and the faith we profess; practical compassion, motivated by an honest and robust engagement with civil and other authorities empowers us to speak out for the poor, refugees and migrants, for the marginalised in all our communities, and for the better stewarding of the creation that is entrusted to our care.^[27]

5.2.2 In reflecting on the life of the Church in Scotland, Pope Francis stated:

I have learned that the emblem of the Church of Scotland depicts the burning bush before which Moses encountered the living God. I am struck by the fact that in this great biblical text the Lord calls himself by a name that will echo down the centuries: “the God of your fathers” (Ex 3:15). In this way, he calls us too, as sons and daughters, brothers and sisters, to enter into a history of prior relationships and to live the life of faith not as isolated individuals and in theory, but within a concrete community, a “we”. For no one becomes a Christian by himself and no one can live as a Christian without others. We belong to the family of believers, of so many of our brothers and sisters who have begun to walk in newness of life through Baptism (cf. Rm 6: 4) and who accompany us along that same path.^[28]

5.2.3 The Private Audience and the warmth of the greetings exchanged reflect the depth of the relationship between our two churches and the journey we have shared in recent times. In the course of the exchange, Dr Browning highlighted the significance of the 50th Anniversary of the ordination of Women to the ministry of Word and Sacrament in 2018 as well as the ministry of the Diaconate which has been an integral part of the ministry of the Church of Scotland since 1888.^[29] We echo the words of Pope Francis and affirm that we ‘belong to the family of believers...who have begun to walk in newness of life through Baptism...and who accompany us along that same path’. The challenge of continuing to walk together on that path is one that we embrace afresh within the context of our shared life together.

5.3 Scottish Episcopal Church

The conversations between the Church of Scotland and the Scottish Episcopal Church entitled: *Our Common Calling*, continue to be fruitful. The latest meeting (3-4 October 2017) took place in Carlisle where we had the opportunity to engage with the experience of churches within the Covenant Partnership in Cumbria and to reflect on lessons for the

future shape of ecumenical sharing within a Scottish context. As highlighted in the Report of the Committee in 2017, the Cumbrian ecumenical experience is one that the churches in Scotland can learn from and we look forward to further reflection on this in due course.

5.4 Church of England

Equally, the conversations between the Church of Scotland and the Church of England occasioned by the *Columba Declaration* continue to offer the occasion for reflection on growth in communion and partnership in mission. The *Columba Declaration* Contact Group, including a representative from the Scottish Episcopal Church, met at Shepherds Dene, Northumberland (15-16 November 2017) to give consideration to a wide-ranging agenda including reception of the ordained ministries of different traditions, Brexit, the 500th Anniversary of the Reformation and the *Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification*, as well as identifying items for the agenda of the Biennial Meeting between the Church of Scotland and the Church of England on 15-16 March 2018.

5.5 United Free Church of Scotland

A joint meeting took place in January 2018 between the Ecumenical Relations Committees of the Church of Scotland and the United Free Church of Scotland. In focussing on matters of common concern, the discussions on the ACTS Review process and reflections on the discussions on Ecumenical Policy that are taking place within both of our churches were of considerable value. It is anticipated that the pattern of Joint Committees will be an ongoing part of the Committee's work.

5.6 Conference of European Churches General Assembly 2018

The General Assembly of the Conference of European Churches (CEC) will take place in Novi Sad, Serbia from 31 May-5 June 2018 on the theme: "You shall be my witnesses" (Acts 1:7-8). The Assembly will consider key presentations on hospitality, justice and witness, as well as the CEC Open Letter "What future for Europe?" which was the subject of a series of regional consultations held across Europe throughout 2017.^[30] The Assembly will determine the priorities and direction of CEC for the coming term as well as electing its Governing Board and Officers. The Assembly will be preceded by a Youth Assembly reflecting on the same theme.

5.7 Community of Protestant Churches in Europe

The 8th General Assembly of the Community of Protestant Churches in Europe takes place in Basel, Switzerland, from 13-18 September 2018 on the theme: "Liberated - Connected - Committed".

5.8 World Council of Churches

On 23 August 2018, the World Council of Churches (WCC) marks the 70th Anniversary of the first Assembly of the World Council of Churches in Amsterdam, Holland in August/September 1948.^[31] A service to mark the Anniversary will be held in Amsterdam on that day and the member churches of the WCC are invited to recognise the occasion in their particular contexts. The Committee is in discussion with the Member Churches of ACTS with respect to marking the Anniversary in the Scottish context. A series of worship resources are being developed in relation to the Anniversary, and we pray with the churches of the global community:

O God,
whose Son Jesus Christ prayed
that all who believe through his disciples
might be one;
help us to proclaim the gospel in your world,
and to live in unity and service,
that strengthened by our common work and fellowship
we may do your will
and at the last be brought together to the eternal home
where you live and reign forever.^[32]

6. CLARIFYING THE VISION: A SEASON OF RENEWAL

The Committee began this Report by noting that it had experienced a season of reviews with respect to a number of aspects of its life and the wider life of the Church. In part, the season of reviews continues. Equally, we believe there is a real sense that we have now entered into a season of renewal. In seeking to clarify a vision of ecumenism for the Church, the Committee believes that it has offered a renewed Policy and will seek, in due course, to offer a strategy which will enable the implications of the Policy to be worked out. The working out of these implications will be realised only in the practice of what it is to be the Church of Jesus Christ in partnership with others. In the Scottish context, and beyond, this will require of us that we act with sensitivity and care and that we demonstrate respect for the traditions of other churches. In

all of this, we recall and repeat what was stated earlier. What it is to be concerned for the ecumenical life of the Church is not a consideration to be 'added on' once all other considerations have been attended to. Rather, it is to be concerned for the very self-understanding of the Church in its local and universal expressions complemented by its self-understanding in relation to the mission of God.

In the name of the Committee

ALISON P MCDONALD, *Convener*
KEVIN MACKENZIE, *Vice Convener*
JOHN L MCPAKE, *Secretary*

Addendum

Rev Alison P McDonald

Alison McDonald has served as the Convener of the Committee on Ecumenical Relations since May 2013, having served a full term as Convener and then agreeing to serve for a further additional year in order to oversee an important transitional period in the life of the Committee. Following on from her service as Vice Convener from 2011-2013, the Committee is indebted to Alison for her contribution during this extended period and particularly appreciative of the stability that her continuing presence has brought to its work. Her time of service has been marked by a season of reviews with respect to the work of the Committee and the Ecumenical Policy of the Church and throughout that period she has articulated a vision of ecumenism which acknowledges the contribution of the past but is conscious of the pressing need to present a renewed vision for the future. In addition, she has served as a member of the Governing Board of the Conference of European Churches and represented the Church of Scotland in this forum with distinction. Throughout all that she has done, Alison has sought to place an ecumenical understanding of the work of the Church at the heart of our self-understanding of what it is to be the Church. Once more, we offer our thanks in gratitude for her contribution to the life of the Church.

In the name of the Committee

KEVIN MACKENZIE, *Vice Convener*
JOHN L MCPAKE, *Secretary*

Appendix I

Local, Universal and Shaped by the Mission of God: An Ecumenical Policy for the Church of Scotland: A Theological Basis

1. **Theological Identity: Three Affirmations**
2. **What do we mean by 'Ecumenical'?**
3. **What do we mean by 'Local' and 'Universal'?**
4. **What do we mean by 'Shaped by the Mission of God'?**
5. **Conclusion**

1. Theological Identity: Three Affirmations

1.1 Identity: The Church of Scotland affirms that it 'is part of the Holy Catholic or Universal Church...worshipping one God...in the Trinity of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Ghost...adoring the Father...confessing our Lord Jesus Christ, the Eternal Son...trusting in the promised renewal and guidance of the Holy Spirit...adheres to the Scottish Reformation; receives the Word of God which is contained in the Scriptures of the Old and New Testaments as its supreme rule of faith and life; and avows the fundamental doctrines of the Catholic faith founded thereupon.' (Article I)^[33]

That is, the identity of the Church of Scotland is rooted in the economy of God as expressed in the life of the One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic Church, which is itself rooted in the life of God as expressed in the Trinitarian nature of God. The life of the One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic Church is embodied in the life of the visible community of the people of God called into being by the Word of God and celebrating Baptism and the Lord's Supper as signifying the one covenant of grace freely offered by the Lord Jesus Christ. Further, the identity of the Church has been shaped by the historical reality of the life of the Church as a Reformed church and understands itself to be *ecclesia reformata, semper reformanda*.

1.2 Unity: The Church of Scotland affirms that it believes 'it to be the will of Christ that His disciples should be all one in the Father and in Him, that the world may believe that the Father has sent Him'. (Article VII)^[34] This affirmation is grounded in the prayer of Jesus found in the Gospel of John

and the prayer may be said to encapsulate the heart of ecumenism. Jesus prays for those who will follow in the apostolic succession:

I ask not only on behalf of these, but also on behalf of those who will believe in me through their word, that they may all be one. As you, Father, are in me and I am in you, may they also be in us, so that the world may believe that you have sent me. (John 17: 20-21 (NRSV))

The prayer of Jesus for the unity of the disciples ('that they may all be one') is in order to realise the mission of Jesus ('so that the world may believe that you have sent me'). Jesus prays for unity in order to enable that mission with unity itself understood as an expression of an integral relationship between the Father and the Son ('just as you, Father, are in me, and I in you'). The identity of the Church of Scotland, as expressed in the *Articles Declaratory*, is in this sense bound up with its understanding of what Jesus intends as he prays to the Father.

1.3 Union: The Church of Scotland affirms that it has historically been obligated since 1929 'to seek and promote union with other Churches in which it finds the Word to be purely preached, the sacraments administered according to Christ's ordinance, and discipline rightly exercised'. (Article VII)^[35] This affirmation is grounded in the distinctively Scottish and Reformed affirmation that there are three 'notes of the true Kirk'. The three 'notes' are: 'the Word to be purely preached, the sacraments administered according to Christ's ordinance, and discipline rightly exercised'.^[36] The extent to which the Church has recognised and fulfilled this obligation is a moot point. Equally, the historical context in which the Article was framed has changed beyond recognition. This being so, we can reasonably seek to interpret the obligation in the light of the present and future situation of the Church within contemporary Scotland.

2. What do we mean by 'Ecumenical'?

2.1 The use of the term 'ecumenical' to describe the work of the Church implies that there is a widely understood and accepted definition of what the term means, and that the concept of 'ecumenism' is itself comprehensively understood. However, experience suggests that this is not necessarily the case and that we might wish to ask: What do we mean by 'ecumenical'? There are 15 uses of the word *oikoumene* in the

New Testament. So, for example, it is used in Matthew 24: 14, Luke 4: 5; 21: 26, Acts 17: 31, Romans 10: 18, Hebrews 1: 6 and Revelation 3: 10; 12: 9; 16: 14 in reference to “the whole world”. Meanwhile, there is a connotation of “empire” with reference to the Roman Empire in Luke 2: 1 and Acts 17: 6, and a probable sharing of these connotations of “whole world” and “empire” in Acts 11: 28; 19: 27; 24: 5. In Hebrews 2: 5 the usage suggests that the present world order; the present *oikoumene*, stands in contrast to the world order that is to come; the *oikoumene mellousa*.

2.2 The term begins to acquire a connotation and significance closer to our modern usage in the 2nd century AD, when *The Martyrdom of Polycarp* (c.155 AD) refers to ‘the catholic church throughout the *oikoumene*’ (5: 1; 8: 1: 19: 2), which may be regarded as the first linkage of the concept of *oikoumene* with that of ‘the catholic church’.^[37] That usage may be said to be formally incorporated within the conciliar language of the Catholic church in the reference within the Canons of the Council of Constantinople (381 AD) to an ‘ecumenical synod’. (Canon 6) At this point, Visser t’ Hooft suggests that ‘the word “ecumenical” acquires the special connotation of that which is accepted as authoritative and valid throughout the whole Church’.^[38] In so doing, he references the ‘ecumenical councils’ which are considered to embody the authoritative teaching of the Church. The Orthodox and Catholic traditions of the Church receive seven councils (325-787 AD) as being ecumenical and thus authoritative, with the Catholic tradition recognising a further series of general councils thereafter.^[39] Within the Reformed tradition, Calvin affirms that we receive Nicea, Constantinople, Ephesus and Chalcedon (325, 381, 431 and 451 AD respectively).^[40] A further development in connotation occurs within the Lutheran communion when the *Formula of Concord* (1577, Latin edition) designates the Creeds of the Church (Apostles’, Nicene and Athanasian) as: *Tria symbola catholica et oecumenica*.^[41] Thus, the Creeds are designated and understood as ‘ecumenical’ in significance.

2.3 These developments in the connotation and significance of the term ‘ecumenical’ may be said to have led to it acquiring a range of complementary meanings; *catholicity*, *conciliar* and *creedal*, with the core underlying sense of reference to “the whole world”.

2.4 With respect to the significance of the term within the modern ecumenical movement, and its particular association with institutional ecumenism, we can point to a range of initiatives in the period immediately prior to and immediately following the First World War. In the first instance, we may highlight the World Missionary Conference held in Edinburgh in 1910 and note that it is understood as marking ‘the symbolic starting point of the modern ecumenical movement’, albeit that ‘there were no Roman Catholic or Orthodox delegates present’.^[42] We shall return to our understanding of ‘mission’ in due course and note that in a very real sense the model offered by Edinburgh 1910 has served as the essential basis for conceiving the pattern of the assemblies and councils of international ecumenical bodies since then.

2.5 Thereafter, and following the cessation of War, we may discern an existential urgency in addressing the collapse of normative understandings of social and political order, particularly to the extent that the pre-War social and political order was understood to have been founded on a normative Christian basis with the Church Universal understood as embodying that norm.

2.6 Thus, alongside Edinburgh 1910 and the missionary concern which animated it, the 20th Century ecumenical movement can be understood as developing out of two further distinctive strands: “Life and Work” and “Faith and Order”, which then came together in the formation of the World Council of Churches in 1948.^[43] The “Life and Work” strand may be said to have begun to self-consciously understand its work as ‘ecumenical’ from at least 1925 onwards with the Life and Work Conference in Stockholm of that year speaking of its work as *communio in serviendo ecumenica*; an ecumenical communion in service to the Life and Work of the Church.^[44] Equally, this understanding begins to be replicated in the Faith and Order Conference in Lausanne in 1927.^[45] Further to this, Visser t’ Hooft suggests that the Oxford Life and Work Conference of 1937 ‘did much to give the word wider currency and to establish its wider and more substantial meaning’.^[46] The Report of the Conference states:

The term "oecumenical" refers to the expression within history of the given unity of the Church...The thought and action of the Church are...oecumenical, in so far as they attempt to realize the Una Sancta, the fellowship of Christians, who acknowledge the one Lord.^[47]

Visser t' Hooft suggests that:

From that time on the term has been used in both the traditional sense of "concerning the Church as a whole", and in the modern sense of "concerning the relationship of different Churches" and "expressing the consciousness of the wholeness of the Church".^[48]

2.7 The coalescing of these senses of the term may be said to be embodied in the various publications associated with the first Assembly of the World Council of Churches which was held in Amsterdam, Holland in August/September 1948.^[49] The ecumenical usage and template now embodied, subject to evolution and development, may be said to provide the essential parameters within which institutional ecumenism is to be understood. To that extent, the term 'ecumenical' may be said to have acquired a further connotation and significance, such that 'ecumenical' is widely, and often, primarily, understood as referring to *institutional* bodies whose goal is the enabling of the call to 'visible unity'.

The Constitution of the World Council of Churches states:

The World Council of Churches is a fellowship of churches which confess the Lord Jesus Christ as God and Saviour according to the scriptures and therefore seek to fulfil together their common calling to the glory of the one God, Father, Son and Holy Spirit...The primary purpose of the fellowship of churches in the World Council of Churches is to call one another to visible unity in one faith and in one Eucharistic fellowship, expressed in worship and common life in Christ, through witness and service to the world, and to advance towards that unity in order that the world may believe.^[50]

2.8 Equally, that model, evolved and developed and adjusted to scale and context, has, in essence, provided the template for the range of institutional bodies that the Church of Scotland has become a member of: Action of Churches Together in Scotland (ACTS); Churches Together in Britain

and Ireland (CTBI); Churches Together in England (CTE); the Conference of European Churches (CEC); the Community of Protestant Churches in Europe (CPCE), and; the World Communion of Reformed Churches (WCRC).

2.9 Within the Scottish, and the wider British and Irish, context, the Swanwick Declaration issued on 4 September 1987,^[51] and the consequent document: *Churches Together in Pilgrimage* published in 1989,^[52] may be said to represent that adjustment to scale and context and to provide the template for the ecumenical bodies that the Church of Scotland primarily relates to within Scotland and the British Isles: ACTS^[53] and CTBI,^[54] with these bodies coming into being on the basis of the template on 1 September 1990. The Churches Together model has effectively shaped the Church of Scotland's ecumenical engagement since 1990 and explicitly forms the basis of the Ecumenical Policy of the Church adopted by the General Assembly in 2005, with a commitment to ACTS being an integral part of that Policy.^[55] Within that timeframe, it will be recalled that the period 1996-2003 saw the development of the Scottish Churches Initiative for Union (SCIFU) and that the proposals for union as developed within SCIFU were not adopted by the General Assembly in 2003.^[56] As noted, the Churches Together model was endorsed by the General Assembly in 2005 and, in the period since then, it would be reasonable to suggest that the Church has understood its 'ecumenical' commitments primarily in terms of its relationship to institutional bodies.

2.10 At present, a review of ACTS is ongoing with the outcome to be determined by a process of interaction between the nine Member Churches: Church of Scotland; Congregational Federation; Methodist Church in Scotland; Religious Society of Friends (Quakers); Roman Catholic Church; Salvation Army; Scottish Episcopal Church; United Free Church of Scotland, and; United Reformed Church. Equally, it should be observed that the present membership of ACTS is constituted by what may be regarded as a relatively limited range of church life within our nation and that it does not include churches from the Orthodox, Pentecostal or Baptist traditions amongst others. Further, it does not include a number of churches within the wider Scottish Reformed community.

2.11 In summing up our reflection upon: 'What do we mean by 'Ecumenical'?', we note that the term has itself

developed and acquired particular connotations over time. Equally, we should not foreclose our minds to the thought that it might be subject to further evolution and development in the light of the contemporary situation of the church in the 21st Century. Insofar as any such evolution and development does occur, integral to it must be the sense that it better enables us to comprehend the unity which Jesus prays for in John 17: 20-21 and, within the Scottish context, to understand our identity as part of the One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic Church.

3. What do we mean by 'Local' and 'Universal'?

3.1 In speaking of the 'local' church, we assume that the reference is immediately and univocally understood to refer to a particular sort of community located in a particular place. Indeed, within the Church of Scotland we understand our distinctive vocation in terms which are founded on a conception of what it is to be located in a particular place and to exercise a particular form of ministry. Article III of the *Articles Declaratory* states:

As a national Church representative of the Christian Faith of the Scottish people it acknowledges its distinctive call and duty to bring the ordinances of religion to the people in every parish of Scotland through a territorial ministry.^[57]

That is, the Church understands its calling to be one in which we exercise a ministry in particular localities ordered according to a parochial, or local, pattern.

3.2 What then is the relation of the local and parochial to the life of the One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic Church? *The Church: Towards a Common Vision* (TCV) devotes considerable attention to this relationship and does so within the context of the affirmation that:

The Church is fundamentally a communion in the Triune God and, at the same time, a communion whose members partake together in the life and mission of God (cf 2 Pet. 1:4), who, as Trinity, is the source and focus of all communion.^[58]

3.3 Essentially, TCV resources our understanding of the 'local' church as a relational body within the communion of the universal Church. At the most basic conceptual level it states:

[T]he local church is simply the congregation of believers gathered in one place to hear the Word and celebrate the Sacraments.^[59]

3.4 With that basic conceptual understanding, the local community of the Church is understood to be a place where:

Every Christian receives gifts of the Holy Spirit for the upbuilding of the Church and for his or her part in the mission of Christ. These gifts are given for the common good (cf. 1 Cor. 12:7; Eph. 4:11-13) and place obligations of responsibility and mutual accountability on every individual and local community and on the Church as a whole at every level of its life.^[60]

3.5 That is, each member of the Church of Jesus Christ is gifted for the service of the mission of Christ in the context of the local community to which they are called, with that community standing in relationship to the Church conceived universally. With respect to the mission exercised by the Church, it states:

The Gospel needs to be proclaimed in languages, symbols and images that are relevant to particular times and contexts so as to be lived authentically in each time and place.^[61]

3.6 That is, the Gospel is seen to be authentic precisely because it is contextualised in particular localities and cultures. However, such contextualisation should not lead to a situation in which one particular form of the authentic articulation of the Gospel is imposed in another cultural context. Thus, a 'legitimate diversity' with respect to cultural forms of expression must be recognised.

3.7 In seeking to hold this insight in a dynamic and creative tension, TCV states:

At the same time, unity must not be surrendered. Through shared faith in Christ, expressed in the proclamation of the Word, the celebration of the sacraments and lives of service and witness, each local church is in communion with the local churches of all places and all times.^[62]

3.8 To this point, TCV has essentially affirmed the place of the 'local' and stated that it stands in a relation of communion to other local communities. How then does it more fully state the nature of that relationship? That is: 'What is the relationship of the 'local' to the 'universal'?

3.9 In seeking to develop its understanding of the 'communion of local churches', we recall the basic conceptual insight that the 'local church is simply the congregation of believers gathered in one place to hear the Word and celebrate the Sacraments', and hear TCV when it affirms:

The ecclesiology of communion provides a helpful framework for considering the relation between the local church and the universal Church... Culture, language and shared history all enter into the very fabric of the local church. At the same time, the Christian community in each place shares with all the other local communities all that is essential to the life of communion. Each local church contains within it the fullness of what it is to be the Church.^[63]

3.10 In so affirming, we may hear an echo of the *Scots Confession* where it affirms that it is in the 'the true Kirk' that 'the Word... be purely preached [and] the sacraments administered according to Christ's ordinance'.^[64] That is, the local 'Kirk' is the place in which 'the congregation of believers gathered in one place to hear the Word and celebrate the Sacraments'. Equally, we further hear the *Scots Confession* when it confesses:

This Kirk is Catholic, that is, universal, because it contains the chosen of all ages, of all realms, nations, and tongues... who have communion and society with God the Father, and with His Son, Christ Jesus, through the sanctification of His Holy Spirit.^[65]

Equally, it affirms:

It is therefore called the communion... of saints, who, as citizens of the heavenly Jerusalem, have the fruit of inestimable benefits, one God, one Lord Jesus, one faith, and one baptism.^[66]

3.11 What then of the relationship of the 'local' to the 'universal' within the life of the One, Holy, Catholic and

Apostolic Church?^[67] In seeking to maintain the dynamic and creative tension between the 'local' and the 'universal', TCV says of the 'local' (and necessarily, of the 'universal'):

It is wholly Church, but not the whole Church. Thus, the local church should not be seen in isolation from but in dynamic relation with other local churches. From the beginning communion was maintained between local churches by collections, exchanges of letters, visits, eucharistic hospitality and tangible expressions of solidarity (cf. 1 Cor. 16; 2 Cor. 8:1-9; Gal. 2:1-10). From time to time, during the first centuries, local churches assembled to take counsel together. All of these were ways of nurturing interdependence and maintaining communion. This communion of local churches is thus not an optional extra. The universal Church is the communion of all local churches united in faith and worship around the world. It is not merely the sum, federation or juxtaposition of local churches, but all of them together are the same Church present and acting in this world.^[68]

3.12 The dynamic and creative tension between the 'local' church and the 'universal' church is the relationship through which the 'universal' is realised in the particularity of the 'local' and the 'local' embodies the 'universal'. This theological insight echoes the biblical insight:

For just as the body is one and has many members, and all the members of the body, though many, are one body, so it is with Christ. For in the one Spirit we were all baptized into one body—Jews or Greeks, slaves or free—and we were all made to drink of one Spirit. (1 Corinthians 12: 12-13 NRSV))

3.13 In seeking to summarise an understanding of the 'relationship between local and universal Church' shared by many churches, TCV states:

They share the understanding that the presence of Christ, by the will of the Father and the power of the Spirit, is truly manifested in the local church (it is "wholly Church"), and that this very presence of Christ impels the local church to be in communion with the universal Church (it is not "the whole Church").^[69]

3.14 Within this vision of the local church, each 'local' church in Scotland is the place in which 'the congregation of believers gathered in one place to hear the Word and celebrate the Sacraments'. In that place, the 'local' church is to live out its vocation in mission, worship and pastoral care and in so doing to represent Jesus Christ through the life of the Spirit.^[70] That is, within the 'local' church, the prophetic, priestly and royal ministry of Christ is to be lived out by 'the whole people of God'. The calling of 'the whole people of God' is rooted in the covenant of God initiated in God's choice of Israel, and in the covenant renewed by God 'in the ministry, death and resurrection of Jesus and the sending of the Holy Spirit'. (Romans 11: 11-36)^[71]

4. What do we mean by 'Shaped by the Mission of God'?

4.1 We have already referenced the World Missionary Conference in Edinburgh 1910 as 'the symbolic starting point of the modern ecumenical movement', and in so doing we highlight the fact that, in the first instance, modern ecumenism was initially shaped in the context of a concern for mission. However, if the term 'ecumenical' has at times been less than comprehensively understood, the terms 'mission', and its more recently conceived and expressed relation 'mission-shaped', might reasonably be said to have been comprehensively over-used. If so, we might ask: What do we mean by 'mission'?

Together Towards Life (TTL) begins by affirming:

We believe in the Triune God who is the creator, redeemer, and sustainer of all life. God created the whole oikoumene in God's image and constantly works in the world to affirm and safeguard life. We believe in Jesus Christ, the Life of the world, the incarnation of God's love for the world (John 3:16).¹ Affirming life in all its fullness is Jesus Christ's ultimate concern and mission (John 10:10). We believe in God, the Holy Spirit, the Life-giver, who sustains and empowers life and renews the whole creation (Gen. 2:7; John 3:8).^[72]

4.2 Having affirmed the relationship of the Triune God to 'the whole oikoumene' created in God's image, TTL then states:

Mission begins in the heart of the Triune God and the love which binds together the Holy Trinity overflows to all humanity and creation. The missionary God who sent the Son to the world calls all God's people (John 20:21), and empowers them to be a community of hope. The church is commissioned to celebrate life, and to resist and transform all life-destroying forces, in the power of the Holy Spirit. How important it is to "receive the Holy Spirit" (John 20:22) to become living witnesses to the coming reign of God!^[73]

4.3 Given this Trinitarian basis for conceiving the nature of the mission, understood in the first instance as the mission of God, TTL asks:

From a renewed appreciation of the mission of the Spirit, how do we re-envision God's mission in a changing and diverse world today?^[74]

It answers:

Life in the Holy Spirit is the essence of mission, the core of why we do what we do and how we live our lives. Spirituality gives the deepest meaning to our lives and motivates our actions. It is a sacred gift from the Creator, the energy for affirming and caring for life. This mission spirituality has a dynamic of transformation which, through the spiritual commitment of people, is capable of transforming the world in God's grace.^[75]

4.4 How can we reclaim mission as a transformative spirituality which is life-affirming?

God did not send the Son for the salvation of humanity alone or give us a partial salvation. Rather the gospel is the good news for every part of creation and every aspect of our life and society. It is therefore vital to recognize God's mission in a cosmic sense and to affirm all life, the whole oikoumene, as being interconnected in God's web of life.^[76]

4.5 In summary, we may say that within this framework 'mission' is conceived, in the first instance, as: Trinitarian, relational and concerned for the creation as a whole and for our integral part within it. Equally, if this constitutes the framework for our understanding of 'mission': What inspires

our vision of 'mission'? Within TTL, the answer is supplied in the concept of the *missio Dei*, the mission of God.^[77] The concept is one that has come to be regarded as axiomatic for our understanding of the nature of mission.^[78] Further, we note that it originates within the context of the international missionary movement and, in particular, at the International Missionary Council conference at Willingen, Germany in 1952 where the concept of the *missio Dei* was conceived. Thus:

Willingen is rightly considered as one of the conferences that have had the most lasting influence on ecumenical mission theology.^[79]

4.6 This is so insofar as it resulted in a paradigmatic shift in the work of the international missionary movement; from *missio Ecclesiae* (the mission of the Church) as the primary focus towards a conception of *missio Dei* (the mission of God).^[80] The Trinitarian nature of the *missio Dei* concept of mission is stated thus:

The missionary movement of which we are a part has its source in the Triune God Himself. Out of depth of God's love for us, the Father has sent forth his own beloved Son to reconcile all things to himself, that we and all men might, through the Spirit, be made one in Him with the Father in that perfect love which is the very nature of God.^[81]

4.7 As said, the concept of *missio Dei* has become axiomatic for our understanding as it has evolved and developed in the years since its conception and may be said to offer a paradigm and a common foundation within which we can understand the nature of 'mission'.

4.8 At this point we ought to ask: What then of the relationship of the Church to the *missio Dei*?

Before we do so we ought to acknowledge the extent to which the centre of gravity has shifted within world Christianity and that the experience of the Church with respect to mission is one of profound change and is often very different in the non-Western world. One dimension of that profound change is what has been called a "post-Western Christian awakening".^[82] Wesley Granberg-Michaelson suggests that:

Patterns of Christian vitality and witness are shifting in breath-taking ways that are reshaping the globe's religious landscape, and Christianity today seems divided in new ways. On the one hand are those churches, largely in the North, and rooted in the heritage of the East and the West, which have a deep sense of the historic Christian Tradition, and an ecumenical commitment to what the Nicene Creed names as "the one holy catholic and apostolic Church". But these churches find themselves struggling to maintain a resonant and vital witness amidst their modern, or post-modern cultures.^[83]

Granberg-Michaelson continues:

On the other hand are those churches, located largely in the South (but moving through migration into the global North) which exhibit a vital, even explosive spiritual power, and are propelling a Christian resurgence within their societies and regions of the world.^[84]

4.9 Thereafter, he suggests that this shift is not only 'geographical' in nature 'but also confessional' and notes the growth in modern Pentecostalism as a pervasive phenomenon within global Christianity alongside a re-shaping of the identity of the 'Evangelical community' as it shares in the spiritual renewal predominantly located in the global South.^[85] Within 'the global South', 'context shapes a witness that is becoming more holistic, integrating personal evangelism and social justice'.^[86] Meanwhile, the churches whose origins lie in the global North and are associated with the Anglican, Orthodox and Protestant traditions, as well as the Roman Catholic Church, and which embody the constituent membership of the World Council of Churches, stand in a relationship to the churches of the global South which is not yet fully articulated. Where these traditions are represented in the global South, they may share in the spiritual renewal being experienced but Granberg-Michaelson contends that:

[T]he movements of fresh vitality and growth that are shaping the future of global Christianity are largely isolated from the structures of the present ecumenical movement, to the impoverishment of both.^[87]

4.10 In response to this shift in the centre of gravity of Christianity in global terms and to the realignment in theological and confessional terms, there has been the

recognition of the need for the creation of a “new space”...to draw those representing the diversity of world Christianity together’ and this has potentially been realised in the creation of the Global Christian Forum (GCF).^[88] Following a period of eight years preparation, the GCF met in Limuru, Kenya in November 2007 and has been described ‘as a watershed in modern Christian history’.^[89] The genesis and development of the GCF is helpfully set out by Huibert van Beek who scopes the development of three movements within global Christianity: Ecumenical, Evangelical and Pentecostal, during the 20th Century. He suggests that:

The Ecumenical, Evangelical and Pentecostal movements are contemporary with one another...and yet: the Ecumenical movement on the one hand, and the Evangelical – Pentecostal – Charismatic movements on the other, have taken their courses separately and away from each other, largely ignoring each other and sometimes opposing and rejecting one another.^[90]

4.11 van Beek suggests that it is within this context that the GCF has emerged at the turn of the 21st Century and, whilst acknowledging that the GCF model is ‘tentative, provisional and fragile’ suggests that it has created ‘a space where the whole Christian family can gather for the sake of unity and common witness’.^[91]

4.12 With this important perspective informing our understanding of the broader experience of mission, let us now ask: What then of the relationship of the Church to the *missio Dei*? TCV states:

The Christian understanding of the Church and its mission is rooted in the vision of God’s great design (or “economy”) for all creation: the “kingdom” which was both promised by and manifested in Jesus Christ.^[92]

4.13 That is, our understanding of the nature of the Church is rooted in our conception of the *missio Dei*, such that the vision of the Kingdom of God animates and informs that understanding. TCV Continues:

According to the Bible, man and woman were created in God’s image (cf. Gen. 1:26-27), so bearing an inherent capacity for communion (in Greek koinonia) with God and with one another. God’s purpose in creation was thwarted by human sin and disobedience (cf. Gen. 3-4; Rom. 1:18-3:20), which damaged the relationship between God, human beings and the created order. But God persisted in faithfulness despite human sin and error. The dynamic history of God’s restoration of koinonia found its irreversible achievement in the incarnation and paschal mystery of Jesus Christ. The Church, as the body of Christ, acts by the power of the Holy Spirit to continue his life-giving mission in prophetic and compassionate ministry and so participates in God’s work of healing a broken world.^[93]

4.14 In this conception of the nature of mission, the Scriptural narrative sets out the intention of God; to create a relationship of communion with those created in the image of God and to do so within the context of the created order. Scripture narrates the faithfulness of God to this intention as revealed through Jesus Christ and ever-renewed by the Holy Spirit. That work of renewal sustains the Church in its ministry and enables it to live out its vocation in mission, worship and pastoral care and, in so doing, to represent Jesus Christ through the life of the Spirit. TCV affirms the thrust of the Scriptural narrative in stating:

The Holy Spirit came upon the disciples on the morning of Pentecost for the purpose of equipping them to begin the mission entrusted to them (cf. Acts 2:1-41). God’s plan to save the world...*missio Dei*...“the mission of God”...is carried out through the sending of the Son and the Holy Spirit.^[94]

4.15 In essence then, the *missio dei* is expressed within the context of the Scriptural narrative and the Church is located within that as the sphere in which Jesus Christ is embodied and the Holy Spirit gives life to the community remade in the image of God.^[95]

4.16 In having set out a narrative account of how we might understand the nature of mission, we might reasonably wish to ask: How do we root such an understanding of ‘mission’ in the context of the ‘local’? One particular approach which has been influential within the Church has

been that which has evolved and developed out of the publication of *Mission-shaped Church* in 2004.^[96] Albeit that the insights presented in *Mission-shaped Church* developed within the context of the mission of the Church of England and the wider Anglican Communion, they have commended themselves to a wider community of interest. At the core of the approach lies the “Five Marks of Mission” which have been commended by and throughout the Anglican Communion.^[97] Equally, *Mission-shaped Church* may be said to have provided the catalyst for the “Fresh Expressions” initiative.^[98]

The Five Marks of Mission are:

1. To proclaim the Good News of the Kingdom
2. To teach, baptise and nurture new believers
3. To respond to human need by loving service
4. To transform unjust structures of society, to challenge violence of every kind and pursue peace and reconciliation
5. To strive to safeguard the integrity of creation, and sustain and renew the life of the earth^[99]

4.17 In seeking to place the Marks within the context of the understanding of ‘mission’ and the *missio Dei* developed with reference to *Together Towards Life* and *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, we see that the opening emphasis on the proclamation of the Kingdom coheres well with the vision of the mission of God focused on the nurturing and discipling of Christian believers within the context of the exercise of a pastoral and prophetic understanding of the Church’s vocation. The integration of the theological basis provided by the concept of the *missio Dei* with the practice of mission in the context of the Church of Scotland and within the broader context of the church within Scotland is a subject surely worthy of further reflection.

4.18 Equally, in reflecting upon the “post-Western Christian awakening” previously alluded to, we note that it is within this context that there has been an evolution and development in the conception of how churches might more effectively relate to one another and specifically so in a context shaped by mission. That context may be said to have been provided by the Global Christian Forum. To the extent that a “post-Western Christian awakening” is taking place

and that the GCF is an authentic response to a shift in the centre of gravity and to the realignment in theological and confessional terms of the various traditions within Christianity, we might expect to be able to discern an emerging consensus with respect to the form in which the traditions express their understanding of unity and mission. This would potentially be so insofar as it is the case that ‘context shapes a witness that is becoming more holistic, integrating personal evangelism and social justice’. It is too early to suggest that an agreed consensus on ‘form’ has emerged within the churches in Scotland.^[100]

However, insofar as shared context shapes our witness and that we affirm that this ‘witness’ ought to be characterised as holistic and integrative, we might wish to reflect on whether our present context requires us to reconceive our understanding of the model of churches-in-relation most consonant with that context. The “Forum Model” has not yet been conceived within the Scottish context. Equally, the Church of Scotland ought not to conceive of how such a model might be characterised and understood in isolation from our partner churches within Scotland. Nevertheless, in concluding our reflection on ‘What do we mean by ‘Mission’?’, we might reasonably ask if the vocation of the Church is to invite our partners to consider with us how we might better serve the mission of God in the local contexts in which we embody and express the universal vision of the One, Holy Catholic and Apostolic Church.

5. Conclusion

5.1 *Local, Universal and Shaped by the Mission of God: An Ecumenical Policy for the Church of Scotland* has sought to place an ecumenical understanding of the work of the Church at the heart of the Church’s self-understanding. To repeat, it is concerned for the very self-understanding of the Church in its local and universal expressions complemented by its self-understanding in relation to the mission of God.

5.2 To that extent, it is conceived in the first instance as a basis for reflection on the nature of the Church rather than as a programmatic statement of strategy or a framework for re-ordering the parishes, presbyteries, Councils and Committees of the Church of Scotland. Nevertheless, were it to fail to raise questions with respect to the latter then it might be judged to have failed in its purpose insofar as reflection on the nature of the Church ought always to raise questions in relation to the life of the Church.

5.3 The pattern of relationships with the various ecumenical bodies to which the Church of Scotland relates cannot exhaust the extent of the Church's 'ecumenical' vision. Nor does the pattern of relationships between the various churches in Scotland, conceived as static and permanently fixed, constitute a sufficient basis for understanding the future vocation and calling of the Church. Rather, *Local, Universal and Shaped by the Mission of God: An Ecumenical Policy for the Church of Scotland* is offered in the light of a concern for the self-understanding of the Church in its local and universal expressions and seeks to complement that self-understanding by placing the Church in its proper relationship to the mission of God. To the extent that it enriches that self-understanding it will have articulated a basis for the Ecumenical Policy of the Church of Scotland.

Appendix II

Ecumenical Landscape

1. The Roman Catholic Church

1.1 The contribution of the Ecumenical Relations Committee with respect to our relationship to the Roman Catholic Church was particularly highlighted with the Roman Catholic Church valuing the strong relationship with the Committee through its permanent representative. A significant change in the 'ecumenical landscape' in the past decade and more is to be found in the changed nature of the relationship between the Church of Scotland and the Roman Catholic Church, with the work of the renewed Joint Commission on Doctrine (since 2000) being particularly important. Equally, the joint response of our two churches to the World Council of Churches Faith and Order statement, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision* (Geneva, 2013), provides evidence of the growing confidence of relationship.

1.2 The joint nature of the response is, as far as is known, unique on an international scale, and the fact that such a potentially significant statement was addressed on an ecumenical basis is indicative of the changed nature of the relationship. *The Church: Towards a Common Vision* is of such significance that further reflection on it within the context of the Church of Scotland as a whole would be of value with respect to the shaping of strategic direction. Equally, the nature of the joint response models a pattern of collaborative working which exemplifies ecumenism at its best. Such collaborative ecumenical working might also be thought to

embed within itself a prophetic dimension with respect to the future shape of the life of the Church within Scotland as a whole.

2. The *Columba Declaration* and "Our Common Calling"

2.1 Equally a shift towards a model which exemplifies a pattern of collaborative working can reasonably be detected in the reception and affirmation of the *Columba Declaration* by the Church of England and the Church of Scotland. No shift is ever without its attendant challenges and many of these relate to issues of language and communication.

2.2 These issues have been especially highlighted with respect to our relationship with the Scottish Episcopal Church. Nevertheless, the addressing of these issues has served as a catalyst which has enabled us to engage together in a renewed process, "Our Common Calling", in which we will seek to reflect on the Faith and Order issues which have historically been before our two churches as well as engaging our churches locally in exploring our common calling.

2.3 As noted, issues of language and communication are of particular significance in ecumenical dialogue and the Committee was strongly of the view that further attention needed to be given to how we communicate with other churches and how, in turn, that is communicated. It would be of value to the whole Church if intentional reflection on this might take place.

3. The Practice of Diplomacy

In seeking to find a metaphor to best describe what the Ecumenical Relations Committee does, the Council thought that it might best be understood as exercising a diplomatic role on behalf of the Church of Scotland within the context of building our relationships with other denominations. The cultivation of a network of contacts beyond the boundaries of the Church is of significant value to the Church. In so doing, the Council recognises the contribution made by the Church to the various national and international ecumenical instruments and the valuable work that the Committee does, through the Ecumenical Officer, in encouraging and supporting our engagement with these instruments.

4. ACTS

Within the Scottish context, the Council was conscious of the significance of the role of Action of Churches Together in Scotland (ACTS) as it works multilaterally within Scotland. It was acknowledged that any diminishing of the work of the Ecumenical Relations Committee would create a vacuum within the Church in Scotland and would have a significant impact on ACTS itself. Equally, the Council would contend that there is an onus on the Committee to be able to demonstrate the continuing value to the Church of our commitment to and support of ACTS.

5. International Ecumenical Bodies

As with ACTS, so also for other ecumenical bodies to which the Church of Scotland belongs. The Ecumenical Relations Committee has successfully facilitated and supported the Church of Scotland's engagement within a range of national and international bodies, enabling valued and highly respected contributions to be made in: Churches Together in Britain and Ireland (CTBI); Churches Together in England (CTE); the Conference of European Churches (CEC), the Community of Protestant Churches in Europe (CPCE), the World Communion of Reformed Churches (WCRC); and the World Council of Churches (WCC).

Appendix III

Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review

The Review consists of three parts, focussing on: 1) Strengths and opportunities of ACTS; 2) Weaknesses and areas of concern within ACTS, and; 3) Possibilities for the future of ACTS.

1. Strengths and Opportunities

In general terms, the Review reflects a strong endorsement by the present membership of ACTS of the need for a body such as ACTS, summarily expressed in the following: "If it didn't exist, you would have to invent it".^[101] That strong endorsement in principle reflects an expressed desire for oversight and direction within the shared life of the churches, albeit that the Review notes a degree of dissension with respect to this.^[102] That said, the need for a "safe space" within which churches can share in 'open conversation' with respect to 'mission in contemporary Scotland' was recognised

as an important contribution by ACTS to the life of the church in Scotland.^[103] Alongside this, the Review highlights a series of issues in relation to the funding available through ACTS for the enabling of shared ecumenical working. Albeit that ACTS does have funding available to enable potential projects, it is not clear that there is an agreed framework within which to approve, support and evaluate those projects.^[104]

2. Weaknesses and Areas of Concern

2.1 Having identified a general endorsement of the principle of ecumenism which underlies a body such as ACTS, the Review notes that this 'generally positive view was balanced by criticism, and on occasion severe criticism, of the current functioning of ACTS'.^[105] This is perhaps best exemplified in the Review's identification of 'a clear mismatch between the original vision for ACTS, members' expectations, and how ACTS currently operates'.^[106] Equally, the Review identifies a lack of clarity among the membership of ACTS as to what the present vision, mission and priorities of ACTS actually are. Further, the recognition that there is a lack of clarity provides 'an opportunity for ACTS to redefine its vision in such a way that encourages current members to increase their engagement and enables the organisation to set objectives which lead to clear outcomes'.^[107] Alongside this, there is an acknowledgement that any such redefinition of the vision of ACTS cannot take place without reference to 'the wider Scottish context' and cannot remain the preserve of the current membership.

2.2 The extent to which ACTS is potentially perceived as being a "closed shop" is highlighted by contrast with the experience of Churches Together in England (CTE) which has experienced, since its inception in 1990, a considerable growth in its membership (from 16 members in 1990, to 45 in 2017) as compared with the static position of ACTS.^[108] In particular, whilst CTE has constructively engaged with the growing number of Pentecostal, independent and 'ethnic minority Churches' within England and embraced many within its membership, ACTS has singularly failed to replicate this within its membership. Of those interviewed by Theos, many 'felt that given the current structure and *modus operandi* of ACTS such Churches are either hindered from full participation or simply do not see the benefits of joining'.^[109] The result of this is a perception that 'ACTS is simply unattractive to Churches or networks outside of the formal ecumenical structures though they might be open to and in fact engaged in inter-church cooperation'.^[110]

2.3 In addressing the continuing relevance of ACTS, ‘the view that ACTS is now out of step with contemporary Church life in Scotland was expressed by almost all interviewees’.^[111] To the extent that this is the case it is now no longer clear that ACTS speaks for the churches in Scotland. Equally, the model upon which ACTS is based, whilst resonant with the church situation in the 1990’s, no longer reflects the reality of contemporary Scottish church life.^[112] In particular, ACTS is perceived as being irrelevant with respect to local ecumenism and that local engagement between churches takes place without reference to it. This point is particularly significant given that the majority of those responding to Theos ‘wished ecumenical work in Scotland to be geared toward cooperation between churches *at the local level*’.^[113] Indeed, such comments are often reflective of an ongoing and healthy pattern of engagement between churches at a local level which stands in contrast with the fact that the ‘vast majority of those who participated in the review process...said that local churches were not aware of the existence of ACTS, let alone felt supported in local ecumenical efforts’.^[114]

2.4 The absence of an ACTS profile at a local level and, in particular, a failure to provide models of good practice is also seen as potentially indicative of the ‘real absence [of ACTS] from the Scottish Church scene’.^[115] These relatively negative perceptions require to be offset by the recognition that ACTS does provide potentially valuable resources and has enabled engagement with contemporary issues such as Brexit.^[116] Nevertheless, there is a clearly expressed preference for ACTS to be primarily engaged in the facilitating of local ecumenism and the development of relationships between churches at a national level, as against a focus on developing social justice projects and speaking out on national and international issues, and thereby establishing its presence.^[117]

2.5 In terms of those who typically participate in the decision-making processes of ACTS there is a clear perception of a lack of diversity and that ACTS is primarily the preserve of those who are ‘overwhelmingly white, older, and male’.^[118] Equally, the processes themselves are perceived as being excessively bureaucratic and cumbersome and potentially lacking in accountability.^[119] In particular, there is confusion as to the respective roles of the Trustees and the Members within the ACTS framework with a resulting lack of clarity in decision-making.^[120] As a consequence, there is a clearly articulated request for a ‘significant restructuring’ of ACTS if it is to continue.^[121]

2.6 Within the present structure, the issue of the present leadership of ACTS drew a diverse range of responses with respect to it being ‘fit for purpose’. Equally, those responding to Theos in interview ‘strongly stated that the current leadership of ACTS...is not serving the best interests of the organisation’.^[122] Further, there is considerable confusion as to what the role of the General Secretary is and a clear request that it should be ‘reimagined to include greater emphasis on the building and cultivation of relationships, both with the member Churches and individual church communities, and with interested parties outwith ACTS’.^[123]

2.7 Underlying many of the issues above is the perception that ACTS is an organisation with poor internal and external communication. This is seen as ‘resulting in poor morale in the ACTS office’ and in a ‘significant lack of awareness of ACTS in Scottish churches’.^[124] With respect to the latter, a lack of coherent communications strategy is seen as a critical factor.^[125]

3. Possibilities for the Future

3.1 In turning to address possibilities for the future of ACTS, a number of broad themes emerge which, whilst not offering a coherent “plan of action”, offer a relative consensus of opinion. That is, if ACTS is to continue to be a national ecumenical body within Scotland, it ought to: 1) Clarify its vision; 2) Re-structure, and; 3) Broaden its base.^[126] All of these suggestions can be seen as a response to the above section on ‘Weaknesses and Areas of Concern’ and as tending towards the provision of a coherent and simplified model with a clear and unifying purpose. Notwithstanding these opinions, a minority of respondents believe that ACTS itself has come to the end of its viability and that it ought to be wound up in its present form.^[127]

3.2 Interwoven with the above discussion, but, perhaps surprisingly, not a predominating theme, is the recognition of the need to consider the relationship between ecumenism and mission. Theos note that in similar research for CTE, there was a far greater emphasis on this relationship.^[128] Theos state: ‘It is our view that ACTS should consider encouraging conversation on this matter.’^[129]

Appendix IV

Delegates to other Churches

The following have been appointed as delegates to the Assemblies, Synods and Conferences of other Churches:-

Presbyterian Church in Ireland - The Moderator, Principal Clerk and Ecumenical Officer

Presbyterian Church of Wales - The Moderator

United Reformed Church - The Moderator

Church of England - Very Rev Dr A Morrison

United Reformed Church Scotland Synod - Rev K Mackenzie

Scottish Episcopal Church - Rev Dr L J Fraser

Methodist Spring Synod - Rev Dr F M Henderson

United Free Church of Scotland - Rev Dr J L McPake

Baptist Union of Scotland - Rev R Blackman

Congregational Federation in Scotland - Mr D Watt

Appendix V

Ecumenical Bodies

The following serve on Assemblies and Committees of the ecumenical bodies of which the Church is a member:-

World Council of Churches

10th Assembly (November 2013)

Very Rev Dr S M Kesting DSG, Mr I McLarty, Ms M Weibye

Central Committee

Ms M Weibye

World Communion of Reformed Churches

General Council (June-July 2017)

Rev I A Alexander, Rev A P McDonald,
Mr A MacPherson, Rev A Schuetz Bradwell

Conference of European Churches

15th General Assembly (May-June 2018)

Rev R Frazer, Rev A P McDonald

Governing Board

Rev A P McDonald

Community of Protestant Churches in Europe (Leuenberg Church Fellowship)

8th General Assembly (September 2018)

Rev A Price

Churches Together in Britain and Ireland

Board of Trustees

Action of Churches Together in Scotland

Members' Meeting

Voting member: Convener of the Committee on Ecumenical Relations (alternate voting member: Convener of the Council of Assembly), non-voting members: Secretaries of the Mission and Discipleship Council, Church and Society Council and the Ecumenical Officer (alternate non-voting members: Secretary of the Ministries Council, General Secretary of the Guild)

Trustee

Rev Dr G Barclay

Joint Liturgical Group

Mr G Fender-Allison, Rev G Gardner

References

- [1] *Reports to the General Assembly 2017*, 6/7-6/11, 6/31-6/33.
- [2] *Reports to the General Assembly 2017*, 16/5.
- [3] <https://www.theosthinktank.co.uk/>
- [4] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review* (London: Theos, 2017).
- [5] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 45-46.
- [6] *Reports to the General Assembly 2005*, 26/13-26/29.
- [7] *Reports to the General Assembly 2005*, 26/26-26/29.
- [8] *Reports to the General Assembly 2017*, 6/10.
- [9] West, M, "Lund Principle", in; Lossky, N et al, (ed) *Dictionary of the Ecumenical Movement* (2nd ed) (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 2002), 633-634. See Faith and Order Commission, *Faith and Order: The Report of the Third World Conference* (London: SCM, 1952), 5-6, and E H Robertson, *Lund 1952* (London: SCM 1952), 70-71.
- [10] Faith and Order Commission, *Faith and Order: The Report of the Third World Conference*, 6.
- [11] *Reports to the General Assembly 2017*, 6/31-6/32.
- [12] British Council of Churches, *Churches Together in Pilgrimage* (London: BCC, 1989), 49-59.
- [13] <http://www.acts-scotland.org/about-us/about-acts>.
- [14] *Reports to the General Assembly 1989*, 363, 423-430. In the cycle 2015-2017, the Church of Scotland contributed £144,000 per annum to the work of ACTS. The ACTS Budget for 2017 anticipated a total income of £234,200.
- [15] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 10.
- [16] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 10-11, 53-54.
- [17] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 13-20.
- [18] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 21-43.
- [19] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 48-49.
- [20] *Reports to the General Assembly 2014*, 7.3/10-7.3/12.
- [21] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 44-49.
- [22] <http://wrc.ch/news/general-council-approves-statement-on-ordination-of-women>
- [23] <http://wrc.ch/jddj>
- [24] <http://wrc.ch/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/WCRC-Association-to-JDDJ-EN.pdf>
- [25] <http://wrc.ch/news/lwf-and-wrc-sign-the-wittenberg-witness-as-wrc-joins-jddj>
- [26] <http://reformation-cities.org/?lang=en>
- [27] http://www.churchofscotland.org.uk/news_and_events/news/2017/moderator_meets_pope_francis_in_spirit_if_true_fraternity
- [28] http://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/speeches/2017/october/documents/papa-francesco_20171026_delegazione-chiesadiscozia.html
- [29] http://www.churchofscotland.org.uk/news_and_events/news/2017/moderator_meets_pope_francis_in_spirit_if_true_fraternity
- [30] <https://www.ceceurope.org/open-letter/>
- [31] The foundational texts for the World Council of Churches are found in: *The Universal Church in God's Design: An Ecumenical Study; The Church's Witness to*

- God's Design: An Ecumenical Study; The Church and the Disorder of Society: An Ecumenical Study*, and; *The Church and the International Disorder: An Ecumenical Study* (All: London: SCM Press, 1948). See also; Visser t' Hooft, W A, *The First Assembly of the World Council of Churches: The Official Report* (London: SCM Press, 1949).
- [32] Collect for the 70th Anniversary of the WCC by the Rev Canon Jeremy Worthen: http://www.oikoumene.org/en/wcc70/prayers-and-songs/collect_prayer-england
- [33] http://www.churchofscotland.org.uk/about_us/church_law/church_constitution
- [34] http://www.churchofscotland.org.uk/about_us/church_law/church_constitution
- [35] http://www.churchofscotland.org.uk/about_us/church_law/church_constitution
- [36] *Scots Confession*, XVIII, XXV.
- [37] http://www.earlychurchtexts.com/main/polycarp/01_martyrdom_of_polycarp_01.shtml
- [38] Visser t' Hooft, W A, "The Word "Ecumenical" – Its History and Use", in; Rouse, R & Neil, S C (ed), *A History of the Ecumenical Movement I: 1517-1948* (4th ed) (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1993), 735-740, 736.
- [39] Visser t' Hooft, W A, "The Word "Ecumenical" – Its History and Use", 736-737.
- [40] Bouwen, F, "Ecumenical Councils", in; Lossky, N *et al*, (ed) *Dictionary of the Ecumenical Movement* (2nd ed) (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 2002), 373-376, 375. See John Calvin, *Institutes*, 4.9.8.
- [41] Visser t' Hooft, W A, "The Word "Ecumenical" – Its History and Use", 737.
- [42] Keum, J, "Beyond Dichotomy: Towards a Convergence between the Ecumenical and Evangelical Understanding of Mission in Changing Landscapes", in; Dahle, L *et al*, *The Lausanne Movement: A Range of Perspectives* (Oxford: Regnum, 2014), 383-398, 385-386. The significance of Edinburgh 1910 has been much analysed, in particular; at the Edinburgh 2010 conference to mark the centenary of the former, with the latter seeking to renew missional understanding for the 21st Century with the "Edinburgh 2010 Common Call". Kerr, D A & Ross, K R, (ed's) *Edinburgh 2010: Mission Then and Now* (Oxford: Regnum 2009), 233-303, provides an indispensable analysis of "Commission Eight: Cooperation and the Promotion of Unity" of the World Missionary Conference held in Edinburgh in 1910 from Ecumenical, Evangelical, Orthodox, Roman Catholic and Pentecostal perspectives. See also; "Edinburgh 2010 Common Call", 2. On this theme at Edinburgh 2010, see [Jackson, D] (ed), "Mission and Unity – Ecclesiology and Mission", in Kim, K, & Anderson, A, (ed's), *Edinburgh 2010: Mission Today and Tomorrow*, 174-182. On the 'paradigms of mission' underlying Edinburgh 2010 and the "Common Call", see; Kim, K, "Mission in the Twenty-First Century", in Kim, K, & Anderson, A, (ed's), *Edinburgh 2010: Mission Today and Tomorrow*, 351-364.
- [43] Braaten, C E & Jenson, R W, *In One Body through the Cross* (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm B Eerdmans, 2003), 18-26.
- [44] G A K Bell (ed), *The Stockholm Conference 1925* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1926), 17.
- [45] H N Bate (ed), *Faith and Order: Lausanne 1927* (London: SCM, 1927), 321.
- [46] Visser t' Hooft, W A, "The Word "Ecumenical" – Its History and Use", 740.
- [47] Oldham, J H (ed), *The Churches Survey Their Task* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1937), 168-169.
- [48] Visser t' Hooft, W A, "The Word "Ecumenical" – Its History and Use", 740.
- [49] *The Universal Church in God's Design: An Ecumenical Study; The Church's Witness to God's Design: An Ecumenical Study; The Church and the Disorder of Society: An Ecumenical Study*, and; *The Church and the International Disorder: An Ecumenical Study* (All: London: SCM Press, 1948). See also; Visser t' Hooft, W A, *The First Assembly of the World Council of Churches: The Official Report* (London: SCM Press, 1949).

- [50] <https://www.oikoumene.org/en/resources/documents/assembly/2013-busan/adopted-documents-statements/wcc-constitution-and-rules>
- [51] <https://ctbi.org.uk/swanwick-declaration/>
- [52] British Council of Churches, *The Next Steps for churches Together in Pilgrimage* (London: BCC, 1989). <https://ctbi.org.uk/books/churches-together-in-pilgrimage-pdf/>
- [53] British Council of Churches, *The Next Steps for churches Together in Pilgrimage*, 49-59.
- [54] British Council of Churches, *The Next Steps for churches Together in Pilgrimage*, 79-101.
- [55] *Reports to the General Assembly 2005*, 26/13-26/29.
- [56] See *Reports to the General Assembly 1998*, 23/14-23/30; *Reports to the General Assembly 2000*, 26/13-26/39, and *Reports to the General Assembly 2003*, 27/8-27/32.
- [57] http://www.churchofscotland.org.uk/about_us/church_law/church_constitution
- [58] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision* (Geneva: WCC, 2013), 14 (s.23). <https://www.oikoumene.org/en/resources/documents/commissions/faith-and-order/i-unity-the-church-and-its-mission/the-church-towards-a-common-vision>
- [59] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 18 (s.32).
- [60] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 12 (s.19).
- [61] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 16 (s.28).
- [62] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 16 (s.29).
- [63] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 17-18 (s.31).
- [64] *Scots Confession*, XVIII, XXV.
- [65] *Scots Confession*, XVI.
- [66] *Scots Confession*, XVI.
- [67] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 13-14 (s.22).
- [68] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 18 (s.31).
- [69] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 18-19.
- [70] Wotherspoon, H J & Kirkpatrick, J M, *A Manual of Church Doctrine according to the Church of Scotland* (Rev. Ed.) (London: OUP, 1960), 4-6).
- [71] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 11-12 (ss.17-19). S.17 states: 'In the call of Abraham, God was choosing for himself a holy people. The prophets frequently recalled this election and vocation in the following powerful formulation: "I will be their God, and they shall be my people" (Jer. 31:33; Ezek. 37:27; echoed in 2 Cor. 6:16; Heb. 8:10). The covenant with Israel marked a decisive moment in the unfolding realization of the plan of salvation.'
- [72] World Council of Churches, *Together Towards Life* (Geneva: WCC, 2013), 4 (s.1). We note also the publication of *The Cape Town Commitment: A Confession of Faith and a Call to Action* (2011) (<https://www.lausanne.org/content/ctc/ctcommitment>) and, His Holiness Pope Francis, *Evangelii Gaudium* (Vatican City, 2013) and the suggestion that these three mission statements represent a consensus in mission thinking across the theological spectrum. On this theme, see; *International Review of Mission* 104.2 (401) (November 2015), *passim*. See; Keum, J, "Beyond Dichotomy: Towards a Convergence between the Ecumenical and Evangelical Understanding of Mission in Changing Landscapes", in Dahle, L *et al*, *The Lausanne Movement: A Range of Perspectives*, 383-398, 384. Engelsviken, T, "The Role of the Lausanne Movement in Modern Christian Mission", in Dahle, L *et al*, *The Lausanne Movement: A Range of Perspectives*, 26-44,

- 29-34, gives a complementary account of the historical period covered by Keum.
- [73] World Council of Churches, *Together Towards Life*, 4 (s. 2).
- [74] World Council of Churches, *Together Towards Life*, 4 (s. 2).
- [75] World Council of Churches, *Together Towards Life*, 4-5, (s.3)
- [76] World Council of Churches, *Together Towards Life*, 5, (s. 4).
- [77] World Council of Churches, *Together Towards Life*, 7 (s. 11).
- [78] Keum, J, "Beyond Dichotomy: Towards a Convergence between the Ecumenical and Evangelical Understanding of Mission in Changing Landscapes", 398, states: 'First, *missio Dei* is a common foundation of mission. Nowadays, whether evangelical or ecumenical, whether mission thinker or practitioner, almost every mission actor and school has accepted the notion of *missio Dei* as their theological basis of mission.'
- [79] Keum, J, "Beyond Dichotomy: Towards a Convergence between the Ecumenical and Evangelical Understanding of Mission in Changing Landscapes", 387.
- [80] Keum, J., "Beyond Dichotomy: Towards a Convergence between the Ecumenical and Evangelical Understanding of Mission in Changing Landscapes", 387-388.
- [81] International Missionary Council, *Willingen 1952: The Missionary Obligation of the Church* (London: Edinburgh House Press, 1953), 2. It should be noted that the reference to *missio Dei* is primarily with respect to the origin of the concept and not to its subsequent reconfiguration. On the latter, see Bosch, D J, *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in the Theology of Mission* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1991).
- [82] Granberg-Michaelson, W, "Foreword", in: van Beek, H, (ed.), *Revisioning Christian Unity* (Oxford: Regnum, 2009), vii-ix, vii.
- [83] Granberg-Michaelson, W, "Foreword", vii.
- [84] Granberg-Michaelson, W, "Foreword", vii.
- [85] Granberg-Michaelson, W, "Foreword", vii.
- [86] Granberg-Michaelson, W, "Foreword", vii-viii.
- [87] Granberg-Michaelson, W, "Foreword", viii.
- [88] <http://www.globalchristianforum.org/index.html>
- [89] <http://www.globalchristianforum.org/what-we-do.html>
- [90] van Beek, "Introduction", in; van Beek, H, (ed), *Revisioning Christian Unity*, xiv-xx, xv.
- [91] Van Beek, "Introduction", xvi. A 'narrative history' of the genesis and development of the GCF is given in; Rowland Jones, S, "The Global Christian Forum – A Narrative History", in van Beek, H, (ed), *Revisioning Christian Unity*, 3-36. In turn; GCF Committee, *Our Unfolding Journey With Jesus Christ: Reflections on the Global Christian Forum Experience* (GCF, 2013) sets out an undergirding theological rationale for the GCF.
- [92] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 5 (s.1).
- [93] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 5 (s.1).
- [94] World Council of Churches, *The Church: Towards a Common Vision*, 6 (s.3).
- [95] The opening sections of TTL (ss.1-11) develop this understanding of the *missio Dei*, and thereafter s.11 sets out a programmatic statement of the narrative to follow with respect to 'understanding the mission of the Holy Spirit within the mission of the Triune God (*missio Dei*)'. The focus is on 'the Holy Spirit within the mission of the Triune God' is reflected in the four key themes which follow on from ss.1-11, namely: 1) Spirit of Mission: Breath of Life [ss.12-35]; 2) Spirit of Liberation: Mission from the Margins [ss.36-54]; 3) Spirit of Community: Church on the Move [ss.55-79], and; 4) Spirit of Pentecost: Good News for All [ss.80-100].

- [96] Archbishops' Council, *Mission-shaped Church* (London: Church Publishing, 2004).
- [97] Archbishops' Council, *Mission-shaped Church*, 81-82. The evolution of the "Five Marks of Mission", and of the approach embodied in *Mission-shaped Church*, may be traced through: Anglican Consultative Council, *The Bonds of Affection* (2nd ed.) (London: ACC, 1984), 49; Anglican Consultative Council, *Mission in a Broken World* (London: ACC, 1990), 101, and Archbishops' Council, *Breaking New Ground* (London: Church Publishing, 1994).
- [98] <https://freshexpressions.org.uk/>; For a critique of *Mission-shaped Church*, see; Hull, J M, *Mission-Shaped Church: A Theological Response*(London: SCM, 2006). For a critique of Fresh Expressions, see: Davison, A & Milbank, A, *For the Parish: A Critique of Fresh Expressions* (London: SCM Press, 2010). For an approach to the "Theological Basis for Fresh Expressions" within the Church of Scotland, see *Reports to the General Assembly 2016*, 16/35-16/39.
- [99] <http://www.anglicancommunion.org/identity/marks-of-mission.aspx>
- [100] Granberg-Michaelson, W, "Foreword", vii-viii.
- [101] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 15.
- [102] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 14-15.
- [103] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 17.
- [104] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 17-19.
- [105] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 22.
- [106] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 22.
- [107] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 23.
- [108] <https://cte.org.uk/Groups/42314/Home.aspx>
- [109] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 24.
- [110] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 27.
- [111] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 26.
- [112] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 26-27. The reality of the changing and increasingly complex picture of Scottish church life is reflected in Peter Brierley, *Growth Amidst Decline* (Tonbridge: ADBC Publishers, 2017), 29-56. Brierley identifies at least eighty three (83) denominations within Scotland.
- [113] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 27.
- [114] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 28.
- [115] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 29.
- [116] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 29-30.
- [117] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 30.
- [118] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 31.
- [119] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 35.
- [120] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 32-33.
- [121] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 33.
- [122] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 36.
- [123] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 37.
- [124] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 39.
- [125] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 41-42.
- [126] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 45-47.
- [127] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 48.
- [128] https://cte.org.uk/Groups/296392/Home/About/Theos_report_on/Theos_report_on.aspx
- [129] *Action of Churches Together in Scotland: A Review*, 49.