

NOMINATION COMMITTEE MAY 2023

Proposed Deliverance

The General Assembly:

1. Receive the Report.
2. Instruct the Nomination Committee to carry out a strategic review of the General Assembly's nomination process and put forward proposals for reform to the General Assembly in 2024 (*Section 1.2*).
3. Make alterations to the Standing Committees of the General Assembly as set forth in the Report (*Section 7*).
4. Reappoint Bill Hewitt as a Convener of the Appeals Committee of the Commission of Assembly (*Section 7.3*).
5. Reappoint David Burns as a Convener of the Discipline Tribunal (*Section 7.3*).
6. Appoint Michael Mair as Convener of the Assembly Business Committee (*Section 7.3*).
7. Appoint Tommy MacNeil as Convener of the Faith Action Programme Leadership Team (*Section 7.3*).
8. Appoint Anikó Schütz Bradwell as Convener of the Iona Community Board (*Section 7.3*).
9. Appoint Marjory MacLean as Convener of the Legal Questions Committee (*Section 7.3*).
10. Appoint Andrew Gardner as Convener of the Nomination Committee (*Section 7.3*).
11. Appoint Adam Dillon as Convener of the Safeguarding Committee for one further year (*Section 7.3*).

Report

1. COMMITTEE REMIT AND PROCESSES

1.1 Preamble

1.1.1 The remit of the Nomination Committee is to identify Ministers, Deacons, Elders and members with particular skills and experience for serving on the Standing Committees of the General Assembly. The Nomination Committee works with the Standing Committees to ensure an open and transparent process for identifying the Convener or Vice-Convener so suggested by the relevant Standing Committee.

1.1.2 The Communications Department created and developed online content to promote the nominations process.

1.1.3 We were pleased to see an increase in the number of nominations this year. We worked with Conveners to find the best match for their vacancies. Some vacancies remain unfilled even though there were nominees who were not invited to accept nomination. This was mainly due to our commitment to achieving balanced membership. The Committee would also like to remind potential nominees and their supporters, that Candidates in Training, Probationers and Ministers in their first year after ordination will not normally be nominated to serve on a Standing Committee.

1.1.4 The Committee continues to encourage individual nominations but in addition there is an expectation that the Standing Committees and presbyteries will also generate nominations each year. All nominations received will go into a general pool and nominees may be invited to serve elsewhere if the committee feel their gifts can be used.

1.1.5 On behalf of the Church, the Committee would like to thank all of those who serve in this way, bringing their gifts, experience and vision to the various strands of work.

1.2 Looking ahead

1.2.1 It is a time of change for the Committee and for the nominations process. The Convener will stand down in May and the Committee is pleased to nominate Andrew Gardner, current Vice-Convener, to become Convener.

1.2.2 Staffing arrangements are also changing with the support and coordination of the nominations processes and the work of the Nomination Committee now moving from the Office of the Assembly Trustees to the Office of the General Assembly. Thanks are offered to Dave Kendall and Carron Lunt for their support and oversight, for their patience, skills and willingness to go the extra mile for committee members. The breadth of knowledge of how the Kirk works and eye for detail have been a key resource to the Committee. We wish them well as they continue to serve the Church in the future.

1.2.3 The Committee welcomed Gordon Macnaughton who took up post as Nominations and General Assembly Support Administrator in January. At the time of writing this Report, it was anticipated that the new Presbytery Resource Adviser would begin in April. The postholder will undertake the role of Secretary to the Nomination Committee and as such will oversee and develop the nominations processes to best serve the needs of the Church.

1.2.4 The new Secretary will lead a strategic review of the General Assembly's nomination process, enabling proposals for reform to be brought to next year's Assembly and will be responsible thereafter to implement the new process.

2. MEMBERSHIP OF ASSEMBLY TRUSTEE SUB-GROUP/COMMITTEE AND APPOINTMENT OF AN ASSEMBLY TRUSTEE

2.1 The Assembly Trustees are responsible for appointing members to its sub-groups/committees. Those who wished to be considered for membership of the new Seeds for Growth Committee and The Church of Scotland's Equality, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) Group were invited to submit a nomination through the nominations process.

2.1.1 The Convener and Vice-Convener represented the Committee on a sifting group also comprising representatives of the Group and the Assembly Trustees. The suggested appointments to the EDI Group were put to the Assembly Trustees when they met on 9 February for agreement.

2.2.2 A selection panel was created to consider membership of the Seeds for Growth Committee with The Church of Scotland's Seeds for Growth Fund scheduled to be launched in January 2023. The Vice-Convener represented the Committee on the panel alongside a representative of the Assembly Trustees and staff from the Grants Unit of the Office of the Assembly Trustees. Interviews were held for the Convener and Vice-Convener roles. The Assembly Trustees were then asked to ratify the appointments when they met on 9 February.

2.2 The above processes and results were intimated to the Nomination Committee when they met in February.

2.3 The Nomination Committee Convener was consulted in March on the process and recommendations for appointment of one new Assembly Trustee in May 2023.

3. NOMINATION TO LEGAL BODIES

3.1 The Committee received names at its February meeting as agreed by the Legal Questions Committee, Principal Clerk and Solicitor of the Church.

3.2 Nominations reported below for the Judicial Panel will result in 21 members. It was anticipated that a request would be made by the Legal Questions Committee to the General Assembly to increase the number of members. Currently it is 20 people being ministers, elders, deacons and members nominated by the Nomination Committee and appointed by the General Assembly.

3.3 The Convener acted under delegated authority to nominate to the Mission Plan Review Group. The two names reported below provide for full membership.

3.4 Two nominations to the Personnel Appeal Group are reported below. The Convener has existing delegated authority to fill any of the five current vacancies should suitable persons be identified by the Solicitor of the Church.

4. NOMINATIONS TO COMMITTEE TO NOMINATE THE MODERATOR

4.1 Although this year's process saw an increase in the number of nomination forms received, there was a lack of nominations for the Committee to Nominate the Moderator 2024. At the committee meeting in February each of the nomination forms received were considered. Members of the Nomination Committee suggested names for consideration. Following the meeting, 3 people were approached to be nominated. A nomination form was not received from 2 of these additional nominees.

4.2 Standing Order 119 states that the Nomination Committee shall not nominate for Committees any of its own number except in special circumstances which must be stated to the Assembly. Due to the challenges once again this year in populating the Committee to Nominate the Moderator an allowance is sought for 1 proposed nominee to join both the Nomination Committee and the Committee to Nominate the Moderator.

5. NOMINATIONS TO THE FAITH ACTION PROGRAMME LEADERSHIP TEAM AND PROGRAMME GROUPS

5.1 Further to the previous Reports of the Assembly Trustees and its 'D10 Group' the Assembly Trustees produced supporting documents and additional information on the Faith Action Programme Leadership Team (FAPLT) and Programme Groups and this was made available on the Assembly Trustees webpage. The Nomination Committee was tasked with making nominations for membership and so this new Agency of the Church was included in the nominations processes for the Standing Committees.

5.2 An insufficient number of nominations were received for the Convener roles and so the Convener sent a communication to those who had indicated that they wished to be considered for membership of FAPLT, to ask them to consider whether they felt called to serve in a convener role.

5.3 Nominations for membership are reported within Section 7. The Assembly Trustees' Report to the General Assembly contains detailed descriptions and remits for the Faith Action Programme Leadership Team (FAPLT) and Programme Groups.

6. FACTS AND FIGURES

6.1 Details on facts and figures are provided as a means of highlighting and encouraging the engagement of the Church as a whole with the nominations process. Figures do not include applications received for Charity Trusteeship which is a separate process.

6.2 A total of 136 proposed nominees were considered with several individuals proposed for more than one committee.

- From the online nomination forms submitted, 1 person stated a preference to attend meetings in person only and 5 people to attend online only. The remainder indicated that they would attend in person or online.
- 1 nominee withdrew due to personal reasons prior to the February meeting of the Nomination Committee.
- 3 nominees withdrew from the nominations process in February.

- 10 nomination forms indicated that they wished to be considered only for the new Assembly Trustees' Seeds for Growth Committee and so these forms were passed to the sifting panel and not brought to the Nomination Committee to be considered for the Standing Committees.
- 15 names were received for the nomination process to legal bodies. Nomination forms were not received and these nominations are not included in the below breakdown.
- Nomination forms were not received from 4 nominees. One nomination was supported by the Standing Committee itself and 3 nominations were supported by the Nomination Committee Convener.

6.3 A breakdown of the 107 nominees considered for the Standing Committees is provided below (the 4 nominees who did not submit a nomination form are included).

- 50 nominations from Ministers (compared with 12 in 2022 and 34 in 2021), with 36 being approached (plus 1 person who was appointed to the EDI Group);
- 1 nomination from a Deacon (compared with 1 in 2022 – the nomination form was edited in 2022 to include nomination from a Deacon), with 1 being approached;
- 5 nominations from Kirk Sessions (compared with 6 in 2022 and 13 nominations in 2021), with 4 being approached;
- 24 nominations from Presbyteries (compared with 1 in 2022 and 4 in 2021), with 20 being approached;
- 1 nomination from The Guild (compared with 0 in 2022 and 1 in 2021), with 1 being approached;
- 7 nominations from Nomination Committee members (compared with 2 in 2022 and 4 in 2021), with 7 being approached;
- 19 nominations from the Standing Committee Convener (compared with 22 in 2022 and 26 in 2021), with 19 being approached.

6.4 A total of 103 vacancies were considered this year for the Standing Committees. Following the above 9 vacancies remain unfilled and the Committee may act under delegated authority to fill some of these.

7. NOMINATIONS FOR APPOINTMENT TO THE STANDING COMMITTEES

7.1 The following appointments will require the General Assembly to suspend Standing Order 122. It is anticipated that the Convener of the Procedure Committee will arrange for that question to be put to the General Assembly at the appropriate point in the proceedings.

7.1.1 The Committee wishes to nominate Adam Dillon for a further one-year term as Convener of the Safeguarding Committee. At the February committee meeting exceptional circumstances were noted which make reappointment desirable.

7.2 The following appointments will require the General Assembly to suspend Standing Order 118. It is anticipated that the Convener of the Procedure Committee will arrange for that question to be put to the General Assembly at the appropriate point in the proceedings.

7.2.1 The Convener plus three members of the Legal Questions Committee will complete their term this year. This is in addition to mid-term resignations received from the Vice-Convener plus two members, making a total of seven members leaving as recorded below. The Committee wishes to nominate two of the retiring members for reappointment noting that one of those has served a second term as a member and that person is nominated to serve for one year only. The Committee also wishes to nominate retiring member Alan Reid, who has served a second term as a member, as Vice-Convener for one year.

7.2.2 Two of the three members retiring from the Theological Forum have specific skills and experience which are of great benefit at this time and so re-election of both, and therefore more than one-half of the retiring members, is desirable. The Committee wishes to nominate both of the two of the three retiring members for reappointment to serve a second term on the Theological Forum.

7.3 The Committee recommends the following appointments:

** denotes a reappointment*

Assembly Business Committee

Convener Retiring Donald McCorkindale

Convener Appointed Michael Mair (Edinburgh: St David's Broomhouse)

Vice-Convener Resigning Michael Mair

Vice-Convener Appointed Sheila Kirk (Deer) (2yrs)

Minister Resigning Sheila Kirk

Minister Appointed Douglas Reid (Edinburgh: Palmerston Place) (1yr)

Audit Committee

Minister Appointed Fiona Anderson (Strathaven: Trinity)

Member Retiring Douglas Horn

Member Appointed Douglas Horn* (West Kirk of Calder)

Chaplains to HM Forces Committee

Ministers Appointed Amy Bender Nov 2022 (Keith: North, Newmill, Boharm and Rothiemay), Neil Galbraith (Glasgow: Cathcart Old), Rory MacLeod (Fort William Kilmallie, linked with Kilmonivaig), Peter Sutton (Edinburgh: St Cuthbert's)

Members Retiring Alexander Bolland*, Colin Hogg*

Committee to Nominate the Moderator

Ministers and Deacons Appointed Mark Evans DCS (Edinburgh: Colinton), John Ferguson (Presbytery of Perth), Joanna Love DCS (Glasgow: Gorbals), Alisa McDonald (Meldrum and Bourtie), Mandy Ralph (Annbanklinked with Tarbolton), Monika Redman Jun 2022 (Muir of Ord Urray and Kilchrist), Julie Rennick (Presbytery of Forth Valley and Clydesdale), Christopher Wallace (East Mainland), Timothy Mineard (Barrhead: St Andrew's)

Minister Withdrawn Elisabeth Spence May 2022

Elders Appointed John Dent (Dundee: Logie and St John's Cross), Helen Eckford (Port Glasgow: New), Barbara Finlayson (Edinburgh: St Andrew's and St George's West), Scott Paget (Lanark: Greyfriars), Jeanette Third (Edinburgh: Colinton), Pauline Weibye (Edinburgh: Craigmillar Park linked with Edinburgh: Reid Memorial), Tom Burnham (Earlston)

Ecumenical Relations Committee

Vice-Convener Retiring Eileen Miller

Vice-Convener Appointed Pauline Weibye (Edinburgh: Craigmillar Park linked with Edinburgh: Reid Memorial)

Minister Retiring David Coulter

Minister Resigned Elisabeth Spence Dec 2022

Ministers Appointed Peter Sutton (Edinburgh: St Cuthbert's) (3yrs), David Coulter* (Guernsey: St Andrew's in the Grange), Eileen Miller* (Burntisland) (3yrs), Alisa McDonald (Meldrum and Bourtie)

Member Retiring Ian Russell

Member Resigning Pauline Weibye

Faith Action Programme

-Leadership Team

Convener Appointed Tommy MacNeil (Stornoway: Martin's Memorial) (4yrs)

Vice-Conveners Appointed Alistair Cumming, Depute Convener and Resource and Presence Programme Group Leader (London: St Columba's linked with Newcastle St Andrew's) (3yrs), Emma Jackson, Public Life and Social Justice Programme Group Leader (Lyne and Manor linked with Peebles: St Andrew's Leckie) (3yrs), Richard Lloyd, Mission Programme Group Leader (Edinburgh: Dalmeny linked with Edinburgh: Queensferry) (2yrs), Bill Wishart, People and Training Programme Group Leader (Edinburgh: St Martin's) (2yrs)

Ministers and Deacons Appointed Morag Crawford DCS (Bathgate: High) (3yrs), Doug Gay (Glasgow: Govan and Linthouse) (4yrs), Michael Goss (Barry linked with Carnoustie) (2yrs), Scott McRoberts (Inverness: St Columba's) (3yrs)

Members Appointed Marie Locke (Stronsay: Moncur Memorial) (3yrs)

Ministers from Presbytery Appointed Lynsey Brennan (Dundonald, Presbytery of the South West) (2yrs), Graham Duffin (Loanhead, Presbytery of Lothian and Borders) (3yrs), Peter Johnston (Aberdeen: Ferryhill, Presbytery of the North East and the Northern Isles) (3yrs), Rory MacLeod (Strath and Sleat, Presbytery of the Highlands and Hebrides) (4yrs), Amanda MacQuarrie (Bo'ness: Old, Presbytery of Forth Valley and Clydesdale) (4yrs), Aaron Stevens (Budapest: St Columba's, Presbytery of the International Charges) (4yrs), Julia Wiley (Armadale, Presbytery of Edinburgh and West Lothian) (4yrs), Graeme Wilson (Bearsden: Cross, Presbytery of Clyde) (3yrs)

Members from Presbytery Appointed Elizabeth Fox (London: St Columba's linked with Newcastle St Andrew's, Presbytery of England) (4yrs), Lorraine Fraser (Dunfermline: Abbey, Presbytery of Fife) (2yrs), Amy-Louise Scott (Arbroath: St Andrew's, Presbytery of Perth) (2yrs), Linda Watt (Glasgow: Langside, Presbytery of Glasgow) (2yrs)

-Mission Support Programme Group

Ministers Appointed Jonathan Fleming (Greenock: Lyle Kirk) (4yrs), Tony Foley (Broughton, Glenholm and Kilbucho linked with Carllops linked with Kirkurd and Newlands linked with Skirling linked with Tweedsmuir linked with West Linton: St Andrews (The West Tweeddale Parishes)) (3yrs), Emma McDonald (Dundee: St David's High Kirk) (4yrs)

Member Appointed John Hodge (Edinburgh: Newhaven) (3yrs)

-People and Training Programme Group

Ministers Appointed Scott Blythe (Netherlee and Stamperland) (4yrs), Irene Bom (Rotterdam: Scots International Church) (3yrs), David Clarkson (Edinburgh: Barclay Viewforth) (4yrs)

Member Appointed Lorna Laughland (Stonehouse: St Ninian's) (3yrs)

-Public Life and Social Justice Programme Group

Ministers Appointed John Ferguson (Presbytery of Perth) (3yrs), Sheena Orr (West Kirk of Calder) (4yrs)

Members Appointed Frances Heafield (Ashkirk linked with Ettrick and Yarrow linked with Selkirk) (3yrs), Valerie Rose (Alloa: Ludgate) (4yrs)

-Resource and Presence Programme Group

Ministers Appointed David Gray (Glasgow: Govan and Linthouse) (4yrs), Timothy Mineard (Barrhead: St Andrew's) (3yrs)

Member Appointed Tom Burnham (Earlston) (4yrs)

Faith Impact Forum Discharged May 2023

Convener Resigned Susan Brown Jun 2022

Interim Convener Appointed Karen Hendry (Glasgow Yoker) Sept 2022

Vice-Convener Resigned Karen Hendry Sept 2022

Interim Vice-Convener Appointed Peter Johnston (Aberdeen: Ferryhill) Sept 2022

Minister Resigned Peter Johnston Sept 2022

Faith Nurture Forum Discharged May 2023

Minister Resigned Robert Hamilton Feb 2023

Iona Community Board

Convener Retiring Tom Gordon

Convener Appointed Anikó Schütz Bradwell (Humbie linked with Yester, Bolton and Saltoun)

Minister Appointed Urzula Glienecke (Edinburgh: St Andrew's and St George's West)

Members Retiring Joanna Love DCS*, Maggie MacKay

Member Appointed Maggie MacKay* (Glasgow: Newlands South)

Legal Questions Committee

Convener Retiring Grant Barclay

Convener Appointed Marjory MacLean (South Ronaldsay and Burray)

Vice-Convener Resigned Victoria Linford Apr 2023

Vice-Convener Appointed Alan Reid (Kinross) (1yr)

Ministers Resigned Marjory McPherson Sept 2022, Adam Dillon Nov 2022

Minister Retiring Alan Reid*

Minister Appointed Fran Henderson (Shetland)

Members Retiring Gilbert Anderson, Andrew Gibb*

Members Appointed Gilbert Anderson* (Glasgow: Newlands South), Shona Cook (Edinburgh: Blackhall St Columba's) (2yrs), Andrew Gibb* (Edinburgh: Corstorphine St Ninian's) (1yr), Eunice McConnach (Aberdeen: Rubislaw)

Appointment to Legal Bodies

-Appeals Committee of the Commission of Assembly

Convener Retiring William Hewitt

Convener Appointed William Hewitt* (Kilmarnock: St Andrew's and St Marnock's)

Vice-Conveners Retiring Janet Foggie, Grahame Lees*

Vice-Conveners Appointed Janet Foggie* (Lindores), Grahame Lees* (Dunblane Cathedral)

-Discipline Tribunal

Convener Retiring David Burns*

Convener Appointed David Burns*

Vice-Convener Appointed Norma Shippin

-Judicial Panel

Minister Resigned Marjory McPherson Sept 2022

Minister Appointed Norman Smith (Lothian and Borders Presbytery)

Elders and Deacons Retiring Tim Edward, David McClements, Robert McDougall

Elders Appointed Tim Edward* (Edinburgh: Wardie), David McClements* (Lenzie: Old), Robert McDougall* (Cambuslang), Janette Wilson (Edinburgh: Duddingston)

-Ministries Appeal Panel

Vice-Convener Retiring Leslie Milton

Vice-Convener Appointed Leslie Milton* (Musselburgh St Andrews High)

-Mission Plan Review Group

Ministers Appointed George Whyte (Edinburgh: Mayfield Salisbury) Nov 2022, Angus Morrison (Edinburgh: Liberton) Jan 2023

Minister Withdrawn Scott Blythe May 2022

Minister Resigned Mike Gargrave Jul 2022

Minister Resigning Angus Morrison

-Personnel Appeal Group

Minister Appointed Norman Smith (Lothian and Borders Presbytery)

Member Resigned Eilidh Wiseman Nov 2022

Member Appointed Grahame Lees (Dunblane Cathedral)

Life & Work Advisory Committee

Minister Retiring Tina Kemp*

Member Appointed Scott Paget (Lanark: Greyfriars)

Nomination Committee

Convener Retiring Julie Rennick

Convener Appointed Andrew Gardner (Dundee Barnhill St Margaret's)

Vice-Convener Resigning Andrew Gardner

Vice-Convener Appointed Bryan Kerr (Lanark: Greyfriar's) (2yrs)

Ministers Resigning Bryan Kerr, Anikó Schütz Bradwell (mid-term appointment Aug 2022)

Ministers Appointed Marc Bircham (St Madoes and Kinfauns), Stephen Blakey (The Isla Parishes), Mark Nicholas (Gorebridge), Linda Pollock (Aberluthnott linked with Laurencekirk), Moira Taylor-Wintersgill (Birsay, Harray and Sandwick) (3yrs), Corne Randall (Aberdeen: Mannofield) (3yrs)

Members Resigned Fiona Blair DCS Mar 2023, Mark Taylor Mar 2023

Member Retiring Daniel Gunn

Members Appointed Lynette Jardine (Uddingston: Old), John Kirk (Edinburgh: St Cuthbert's), John Dent (Dundee: Logie and St John's Cross)

Registration of Ministries Committee

Convener Resigned Hazel Hastie Apr 2023

Safeguarding Committee

Convener Retiring Adam Dillon

Convener Appointed Adam Dillon* (Glasgow: Sherbrooke Mosspark) (1yr)

Social Care Council – CrossReach Board

Vice-Convener Retiring Sarah Wood

Vice-Convener Appointed Mike Cantlay (Callander)

Minister Appointed David Nicolson (Erskine)

Member Resigning Mike Cantlay

Members Retiring Jo Elliot, Christine Johnson

Members Appointed Donald Carmichael (Giffnock: Orchardhill), Christine Johnson* (Edinburgh: Gracemount linked with Edinburgh: Liberton), Lorna Gilhooly (Edinburgh: Gracemount linked with Edinburgh: Liberton) (1yr)

Theological Forum

Ministers Retiring Lynn McChlery, Ruth Morrison*

Ministers Appointed Rebecca Bartocho (Williamwood), Lynn McChlery* (Auchterarder)

Member Retiring Jennifer Stark

Member Appointed Jennifer Stark* (Edinburgh: St Andrew’s and St George’s West)

In the name of the Committee

JULIE RENNICK, *Convener*
ANDREW GARDNER, *Vice-Convener*
DAVE KENDALL, *Secretary*

Addendum

Julie Rennick, Convener

Julie Rennick has brought many gifts and skills in her leadership of the Nomination Committee. She has helped the committee navigate a period of significant change when the Covid-19 pandemic meant that meetings moved from in person to online. Julie’s personable manner has helped new members of the committee feel welcome and integrate well. Julie’s dynamism and energy has helped the committee’s voice to be heard during a time of challenge and change for the Kirk. Her clarity of thinking and capacity for hard work have been appreciated, particularly as new structures have evolved and new groups have sought the best people to serve Christ in his Church

In the name of the Committee

ANDREW GARDNER, *Vice-Convener*
DAVE KENDALL, *Secretary*