# MINUTES OF MINISTRIES APPEAL PANEL

### Minute - 14 September 2021, 11am

On the fourteenth day of September 2021 at 11am the Ministries Appeal Panel met via Microsoft Teams and was duly constituted with prayer.

Sederunt: Mr Robin Stimpson (Convener), Mr Andrew Gibb, Rev Leslie Milton, Mrs Isabell Montgomerie

## The Appellant appeared via video conference.

For the Faith Nurture Forum: Rev John McMahon, Director of the Assessment Conference, and Rev Dr Lezley Stewart, Recruitment and Support Secretary

In attendance: Rev Dr George J Whyte, Principal Clerk and Ms Christine Paterson, Depute Clerk

Introductions were made and the Convener explained the purpose of the hearing.

The Ministries Appeal Panel took up consideration of an Appeal in terms of the Selection and Training for Full-Time Ministry Act (Act X 2004), section 6, against a decision of the National Assessment Conference on 24 April 2021 not to accept the Appellant as a Candidate in training for Full-Time Ministry of Word and Sacrament in the Church of Scotland.

Parties were heard.

Questions were asked.

Parties made closing statements.

It was noted that the Panel's decision would be intimated to the parties by email.

Parties withdrew.

Following deliberation the Ministries Appeal Panel resolved unanimously to dismiss the appeal and to uphold the decision of the Assessment Conference not to accept the Appellant as a Candidate in training for Full-Time Ministry of Word and Sacrament in the Church of Scotland.

The Ministries Appeal Panel did not identify any incorrect material fact which influenced the decision, nor did the Ministries Appeal Panel identify any irregularities in the process or breach of the principles of natural justice which affected the decision reached.

The Grace was said.

The hearing was closed.

ROBIN STIMPSON, Convener GEORGE J WHYTE, Clerk

# Minute - 14 September 2021, 2pm

On the fourteenth day of September 2021 at 2pm the Ministries Appeal Panel met via Microsoft Teams and was duly constituted with prayer.

Sederunt: Mr Robin Stimpson (Convener), Mr Andrew Gibb, Rev Dr Leslie Milton, Mrs Isabell Montgomerie.

# The Appellant appeared via video conference and was accompanied.

For the Faith Nurture Forum: Rev Alastair Duncan, Director of the Assessment Conference, and Rev Dr Lezley Stewart, Recruitment and Support Secretary.

In attendance: Rev Dr George J Whyte, Principal Clerk.

Introductions were made and the Convener explained the purpose of the hearing.

The Ministries Appeal Panel took up consideration of an Appeal in terms of the Selection and Training for Full-Time Ministry Act (Act X 2004), section 6, against a decision of the National Assessment Conference on 27 May 2021 not to accept the Appellant as a Candidate in training for Full-Time Ministry of Word and Sacrament in the Church of Scotland.

Parties were heard.

Questions were asked.

Parties made closing statements.

It was noted that the Panel's decision would be intimated to the parties by email.

Parties withdrew.

Following deliberation the Ministries Appeal Panel resolved unanimously to dismiss the appeal and to uphold the decision of the Assessment Conference not to accept the Appellant as a Candidate in training for Full-Time Ministry of Word and Sacrament in the Church of Scotland.

The Ministries Appeal Panel did not identify any incorrect material fact which influenced the decision, nor did the Ministries Appeal Panel identify any irregularities in the process or breach of the principles of natural justice which affected the decision reached.

The Grace was said. The hearing was closed.

### ROBIN STIMPSON, Convener GEORGE J WHYTE, Clerk

#### Minute - 7 December 2021, 11am

On the seventh day of December 2021 at 11am the Ministries Appeal Panel met via Microsoft Teams and was duly constituted with prayer.

Sederunt: Mr Robin Stimpson (Convener), Rev Leslie Milton (Vice-Convener), Mr Andrew Gibb, Mrs Isabell Montgomerie

Panel member observing: Rev Dr Amos Chewachong

#### The Appellant appeared via video conference and was accompanied.

For the Faith Nurture Forum: Rev Donald Campbell, Admissions Conference Director, and Rev Dr Lezley Stewart, Recruitment and Support Secretary

In attendance: Rev Dr George J Whyte, Principal Clerk and Ms Christine Paterson, Depute Clerk

Introductions were made and the Convener explained the purpose of the hearing.

The Ministries Appeal Panel took up consideration of an Appeal in terms of the Admission and Re-Admission of Ministers Act (Act IX 2002) against a decision of the Admissions Conference on 3 September 2021 not to accept the Appellant as an Admissions Candidate for Ministry in the Church of Scotland.

Parties were heard.

Questions were asked.

Parties made closing statements.

The Convener advised that the Panel's decision would be intimated to the parties by email.

Parties withdrew.

Following deliberation the Ministries Appeal Panel resolved unanimously to dismiss the appeal and to uphold the decision of the Admissions Conference not to accept the Appellant as an Admissions Candidate for Ministry in the Church of Scotland.

The Ministries Appeal Panel did not identify any incorrect material fact which influenced the decision, nor did the Ministries Appeal Panel identify any breach of the principles of natural justice which affected the decision reached.

The Grace was said.

The hearing was closed.

ROBIN STIMPSON, Convener GEORGE J WHYTE, Clerk