

NOMINATION COMMITTEE MAY 2021

Proposed Deliverance

The General Assembly:

1. Receive the Report.
2. Thank those who responded to the call for nominations and encourage members, Elders, Deacons and Ministers to consider nomination for the 2021-22 process.
3. Invite each of the Standing Committees to reconsider its constitution and confirm the appropriate number of General Assembly appointed members which is required. *(Section 1.4)*
4. Note that Candidates in Training, Probationers and Ministers in their first year after ordination will not normally be nominated to serve on Standing Committees. *(Section 1.4.3)*
5. Make alterations to the Unincorporated Entities of the Church as set forth in the Report. *(Section 8)*
6. Appoint James Drummond Young as a Convener of the Judicial Commission. *(Section 8.2)*
7. Appoint Shona Haldane as a Convener of the Discipline Tribunal. *(Section 8.3)*
8. Appoint Hazel Hastie as Convener of the Registration of Ministries Committee. *(Section 8.4)*
9. Appoint Liam Fraser as Convener of the Theological Forum. *(Section 8.4)*

Report

1. COMMITTEE REMIT AND PROCESSES

1.1 Preamble

1.1.1 It has long been the practice that nominations to all the Standing Committees are sought throughout the year. In previous years a nomination form has been physically issued to Commissioners of the General Assembly on the Nomination Committee reporting day. The main appeal for nominations is made in the autumn with a deadline of the end of November. However, the Committee has often found that nominations are received right through to the New Year and the Committee would meet mid-January to consider the nominees and match them up with the vacancies.

1.1.2 During the summer months each of the Standing Committees is asked to provide an information sheet for potential new members and this is made available on the Nomination Committee webpage. This is an opportunity to invite the Convener to confirm which areas of expertise will be sought in new members and to consider succession planning. Where vacancies occur during the year, the relevant Committee, after consultation with the Convener of the Nomination Committee, may appoint a replacement member. Conveners are therefore encouraged to discuss mid-term vacancies at the earliest opportunity.

1.2 The Year 2020

1.2.1 The invitations to seek nominations were sent out in October 2020, sadly this did not elicit a speedy or adequate response and a reminder message was sent a few weeks prior to the initial deadline of November 30. Although more nominations were received it was soon clear that we did not have enough names to fill the anticipated vacancies. The deadline was extended, and a further request sent out at the start of the New Year. This in turn meant delaying the Committee meeting trusting that more nomination forms would be received.

1.2.2 It is believed that the lockdown, with the extra stress of working and living within new restrictions coupled to uncertainty about the Church of the future, contributed to the shortfall. This year feedback indicates that many people found they did not have energy to add a new commitment. However, several of those who did put their names forward specifically expressed a desire to help because of the impact of the pandemic which is a positive.

1.2.3 The Committee met in February 2021, by which time a good pool of nominations had been received for consideration resulting in the proposed nominations as set out within Section 8.

1.2.4 Following the February Committee meeting one of the proposed Forum nominees was ruled as ineligible due to being an employee of the Church. The Convener, under delegated authority, chose another person for nomination to serve on the Forum. The name is reported within Section 8.

1.3 Nomination to Legal Bodies

1.3.1 The Committee received names at its February meeting as agreed by the Legal Questions Committee, Principal Clerk and Solicitor. It was once again noted that in receiving the names for reappointments, the people involved had not been asked to submit a Nomination Form when that had been done within the past four years.

1.4 Going Forward

1.4.1 The time of the pandemic has caused every area of Church life to be examined; the way we recruit our volunteers; the way we meet; and the numbers involved in each Standing Committee all have the potential to be considered for adjustment. In recent years the numbers of vacancies and the demands expected from them have changed significantly; the move from four Councils with a

combined number of more than 140 members, to two Forums with just 15 members each; has consequently led to expecting more from those volunteers. The nature of what we do has changed.

1.4.2 If we are to be realistic about time and financial commitments, then now is the time to review committee membership. Also, some Standing Committees have a specialist remit; others have a wide-ranging set of tasks to perform. Some committees recognise that they could work well with fewer members whilst others express a need to add to their number. In light of these observations, the Committee invites each of the Standing Committees to reconsider its constitution and membership numbers.

1.4.3 While it is encouraging to receive good numbers of nominations, the Committee has adopted a policy of not accepting nominations of Candidates in Training, Probationers or Ministers in their first year following ordination. It is felt that the high expectations that are placed upon this stage of formation are enough without adding service on a Standing Committee.

2. COMMITTEE TO NOMINATE THE MODERATOR

2.1 As reported at the General Assembly in October 2020, the Commission of the General Assembly in May 2020 instructed the Nomination Committee to appoint members to the Committee to Nominate the Moderator of the General Assembly 2021. In terms of *Regulation I 2013 Nomination of the Moderator (as emended in 2020)* the Nomination Committee will make recommendations for membership of the Committee to Nominate the Moderator for General Assembly which is incorporated as part of the nominations process. The Committee Convener worked with the Moderator to create a short video on the task of the Committee to Nominate the Moderator and found this elicited a very positive response. It is hoped that in future years there may be a similar campaign and that those with recent experience of General Assembly may feel inspired to be nominated.

3. APPOINTMENT OF ASSEMBLY TRUSTEES

3.1 The Vice-Convener was invited to comment on a mid-term vacancy for an Assembly Trustee and an appointment was made in December 2020. Details are provided in the report from the Assembly Trustees to the General Assembly in May 2021.

3.2 The Committee Vice-Convener was also consulted as to any comments which he wished to make on the Trustees' interview panel's recommendations for appointment of Trustees in May 2021.

4. PERSONNEL APPEAL GROUP

4.1 A review of procedures by the Solicitor of the Church led to proposals to increase the number of people which sit on the Personnel Appeal Group; to introduce a limit on the term of service to four years, with the option of appointment for a further four-year term; and that powers should be given to the Convener and Vice-Convener of the Nomination Committee to approve the co-option of individuals to the Panel as would be agreed with the Solicitor of the Church, as Secretary to the Group. These proposals are set out in the Assembly Trustees Report to the General Assembly 2021.

4.2 Subject to General Assembly approval to an increase in numbers, the Committee is content that the Convener and Vice-Convener should act under delegated authority to appoint members.

4.3 The Convener will act under delegated authority to fill the two current vacancies should suitable persons be identified in conversation with the Solicitor of the Church.

5. CHAPLAINS TO HER MAJESTY'S FORCES COMMITTEE

5.1 The Committee noted that over the coming year the Chaplains to Her Majesty's Forces Committee would look to review their constitution in consultation with the Assembly Trustees and the Nomination Committee. The outcomes of discussions will be reported to the General Assembly in 2022 and it was anticipated by the Convener of the Chaplains to Her Majesty's Forces Committee that this would include a proposal to reduce the number of members.

5.2 One nomination is reported meaning that the Committee will run with six vacancies unfilled during this coming year.

6. CHURCH OF SCOTLAND EQUALITY, DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION GROUP

6.1 The Convener and Vice-Convener were involved, on behalf of the Committee, in decisions on the initial membership of a newly established group.

7. FACTS AND FIGURES

7.1 Details on facts and figures are provided as a means of highlighting and encouraging the engagement of the Church as a whole with the nominations process. Figures do not include applications received for Charity Trusteeship.

7.2 A total of 97 proposed nominees were considered with some individuals proposed for more than one committee.

7.2.1 15 names were received for the nomination process to legal bodies.

7.2.2 82 nomination forms were considered for the Standing Committees (the Unincorporated Entities). In addition, 1 nominee withdrew due to personal reasons prior to the February meeting and is not included in the totals or below breakdown:

- 34 nominations from Ministers (compared with 58 in 2020 and 56 in 2019), with 17 being approached;
- 13 nominations from Kirk Sessions (compared with 14 in 2020 and 9 in 2019), with 8 being approached;
- 4 nominations from Presbyteries (compared with 16 in 2020 and 24 in 2019), with 2 being approached;
- 1 nomination from The Guild (compared with 1 in 2020 and 4 in 2019), with 1 being approached;
- 4 nominations from Nomination Committee members (compared with 2 in 2020 and 15 in 2019), with 3 being approached;
- 26 nominations from the Unincorporated Entities (compared with 41 in 2020 and 76 in 2019), with 21 being approached.
- A total of 69 vacancies were considered this year for the Unincorporated Entities. 2 of those approached are nominated to serve on 2 Standing Committees. 15 vacancies remain unfilled and the Committee may act under delegated authority to fill some of these.

7.2.3 Subsequent to the above details, one of the proposed nominees has become ineligible due to accepting nomination to be an Assembly Trustee. The vacancy created will be considered with the 15 mentioned above.

8. NOMINATIONS FOR APPOINTMENT TO THE UNINCORPORATED ENTITIES

8.1 The following appointment will require the General Assembly to suspend Standing Order 122. It is anticipated that the Business Convener will arrange for that question to be put to the General Assembly at the appropriate point in the proceedings.

8.1.1 The Committee wishes to nominate The Very Rev William Hewitt for a further term, for three years, as one of the Vice-Conveners of the Judicial Commission.

8.2 The Committee wishes to nominate the Hon Lord Drummond Young as an additional Convener of the Judicial Commission. The Judicial Commission would then have three Conveners and two Vice-Conveners.

8.3 Noting the elevated professional status of one of the current Vice-Conveners of the Discipline Tribunal, as a Senator of the College of Justice, the Committee wishes to nominate the Hon Lady Haldane as a Convener for a term of four years. The Discipline Tribunal would then have four Conveners and two Vice-Conveners.

8.4 The Committee recommends the following appointments:

** denotes a reappointment*

Assembly Business Committee

Ministers Retiring Michael Mair, Gillian Paterson
Ministers Appointed John Ferguson (Peterculter), Michael Mair* (Edinburgh: St David's Broomhouse)

Audit Committee

Minister Retiring Graeme Glover
Minister Appointed Graeme Glover* (Jersey: St Columba's)

Chaplains to HM Forces Committee

Minister Resigned Daniel Connolly Jan 2021
Ministers Retiring Fiona Ogg, Lisa-Jane Rankin
Member Retiring Ethne Brown
Members Appointed Andrew Tait (London Crown Court)

Church Art & Architecture Committee (CARTA) Discharged Dec 2020

Committee to Nominate the Moderator

Ministers and Deacons Appointed Stephen Blakey (Isla Parishes), Alison Burnside (The Bengairn Parishes linked with Castle Douglas), Robert Craig (Breich Valley), Dorothy Getliffe DCS (Inverness: Old High St Stephen's), Graeme Glover (Jersey: St Columba's), Alison Meikle (Grangemouth: Zetland), Anne Mulligan DCS (Edinburgh: Mayfield Salisbury), Christine Murdoch (Craigrownie linked with Garelochhead linked with Rosneath St Modan's)
Elders Appointed Alison Armstrong (Laggan and Newtonmore), Angus Grant (Edinburgh: St Catherine's Argyle), Jean Hunter (Shiskine), Stuart Kelly (Cheviot Churches), John McCafferty (Maryculter Trinity), Norma Rolls (Edinburgh: Palmerston Place), Colin Russell (Wishaw: Old)

Ecumenical Relations Committee

Minister Deceased Sally Russell Nov 2020
Member Retiring Gemma King
Members Appointed Gemma King* (Edinburgh: Colinton), Ian Russell (Torphichen) (2yrs)

Faith Impact Forum

Members Resigned Caroline Cowan Nov 2020, Barry Watson Jan 2021
Members Retiring Maureen Jack, Mary Sweetland
Minister Appointed Alistair Drummond (Kilmuir & Logie Easter)
Members Appointed Martin Ashing (Edinburgh: Palmerston Place), Marian Macintyre (Shetland), Gordon Sharp (Dundee: West)

Faith Nurture Forum

Ministers Retiring Michael Goss, Fraser Macnaughton, Hanneke Marshall
Ministers Appointed Catherine Beattie (Giffnock: South), Robert Hamilton (Airdrie: New Wellwynd), Grant MacLaughlan (Perth: North), Robin McAlpine (Kirkcaldy: Bennochty)
Member Retiring Sue Thomson

Legal Questions Committee

Vice-Convener Retiring Barbara Finlayson
Vice-Convener Appointed Victoria Linford (Stow: St Mary of Wedale and Heriot)
Minister Resigned Victoria Linford
Minister Retiring Adam Dillon
Minister Appointed Adam Dillon* (Kirkintilloch: St David's Memorial Park)
Member Retiring James McLean*
Member Appointed John Ritchie (Edinburgh: Barclay Viewforth)

Appointment to Legal Bodies

Discipline Tribunal

Vice-Conveners Resigning Shona Haldane, Keith Stewart
Convener Appointed Shona Haldane (Edinburgh: Wardie)

Judicial Commission

Convener Appointed James Drummond Young
Vice-Convener Retiring William Hewitt
Vice-Convener Appointed William Hewitt* (Kilmarnock: St Andrew's and St Marnock's) (3yrs)

Judicial Panel

Ministers Retiring Marian Cowie, Gordon McCracken, Jan Mathieson, MaryAnn Rennie
Ministers Appointed Gordon McCracken* (Hamilton Presbytery), Ian McLean (Montrose: Old and St Andrew's), Jan Mathieson* (Williamwood), MaryAnn Rennie* (Dunfermline Abbey)
Elders Retiring Steuart Dey, Chris Dunn, Douglas Hamill, Pauline Weibye
Elders Appointed Fiona Drysdale (Bearsden: New Kilpatrick), Chris Dunn* (Cumbernauld: Kildrum), Douglas Hamill* (Kirkcaldy Linktown), Pauline Weibye* (Edinburgh: Craigmillar Park)

Judicial Proceedings Panel

Ministers Retiring Dorothy Anderson*, George Cowie, William Hewitt, Gary Peacock, Thomas Pollock, Thomas Riddell*
Elders and Deacons Retiring Morag Crawford DCS*, Alan Dewar*, Grant Gordon, Richard Henderson*, Patricia Kingston, Nigel Lawrie*, Anne Mulligan DCS*, Katherine Taylor
The Discipline of Ministry Act (Act III 2001) provides that anyone who has an active case remains on the Judicial Proceedings Panel until their case is complete.
The following Minister is retained: Thomas Pollock* (Glasgow: Sherbrooke Mosspark)
The following Elder and Deacon are Retained: Richard Henderson* (Balerno), Anne Mulligan DCS* (Edinburgh: Mayfield Salisbury)

Ministries Appeal Panel

Member Retiring Isabell Montgomerie
Member Appointed Isabell Montgomerie* (Ochiltree)

Life & Work Advisory Committee

Ministers Appointed Jane Barron (Ceres, Kemback and Springfield)
Member Retiring Andrew Nicoll
Member Appointed Jane Robson (Edinburgh: Cramond)

Nomination Committee

Ministers Retiring Catherine Buchan, Karen Harbison, Ian Murray, Andrew Philip, Colin Sutherland
Ministers Appointed Donald Campbell, (Dumfries: St George's), Bryan Kerr (Lanark: Greyfriars), Alison Meikle (Grangemouth: Zetland)
Member Resigned Robin Downie Dec 2020
Members Retiring Barbara Leppard, Kay McIntosh DCS
Andrew MacPherson, Elspeth McPheat DCS, John Stewart
Members Appointed Fiona Blair DCS (Beith), Jonathan Buchan (Glasgow: King's Park), Connor MacFadyen (Tranent)

Personnel Appeal Group

Member Deceased Alistair McGregor

Member Resigning David McClements is now disqualified as he has joined the Legal Questions Committee

Registration of Ministries Committee

Convener Retiring Neil Dougall

Convener Appointed Hazel Hastie (Edinburgh: Drylaw)

Vice-Convener Retiring Hazel Hastie

Vice-Convener Appointed Fiona Smith (Inverness: Ness Bank)

Safeguarding Committee

Vice-Convener Retiring Caroline Deerin

Vice-Convener Appointed Fiona Reynolds (Monifieth)

Minister Resigning Fiona Reynolds

Minister Retiring Julia Wiley

Ministers Appointed Sonia Blakesley (Paisley: St Mark's Oldhall), Elspeth McKay (Cumbernauld: Old) (3yrs)

Member Resigned Alison MacVie Jan 2021

Member Appointed Judy Wilson (Cardross)

Social Care Council - CrossReach Board

Member Retiring Amy Reid

Member Appointed Amy Reid* (Cumbernauld: Old)

Theological Forum

Convener Retiring Donald MacEwan

Convener Appointed Liam Fraser (Linlithgow: St Michael's)

Vice-Convener Resigning Liam Fraser

Vice-Convener Appointed Susan Hardman Moore (Comrie)

Minister Resigning Susan Hardman Moore

Ministers Retiring Jean Kirkwood, Paul Middleton, Alastair Symington

Ministers Appointed John Carswell (Hamilton: Cadzow), Paul Middleton* (Edinburgh: St Cuthbert's)

Members Appointed Joshua Ralston (Edinburgh: Portobello and Joppa), Jennifer Stark (Edinburgh: St Andrew's and St George's West) (2yrs)

In the name of the Committee

JULIE RENNICK, *Convener*
BILL WISHART, *Vice-Convener*
DAVE KENDALL, *Secretary*